

LANGUAGE AND LITERACY PRESCHOOL CURRICULUM CONSUMER REPORT



THE NATIONAL CENTER ON
Quality Teaching
and Learning



The *Language and Literacy Preschool Curriculum Consumer Report* was developed before the 2015 release of the *Head Start Early Learning Outcomes Framework*. As a result, you will find references in this report to items associated with its predecessor; the *Head Start Child Development and Early Learning Framework*, published in 2010. Please know that the domains and domain elements of the *Head Start Child Development and Early Learning Framework* are still applicable for reviewing effective curricula.

SUMMER 2015



Introduction	2	Prioritizing Components	9
Purpose		No Curriculum Is Perfect	
Target Audience		Strengths and Weaknesses of Your Program	
Overview of the Report		Process of Prioritizing	
Included Language and Literacy Preschool Curricula	3	Enhancing a Curriculum	10
Selection Criteria		Suggestions for Ways to Enhance a Curriculum to Meet the Needs of Your Program	
Definition of Curriculum		Curricula Ratings	10
Availability of Curriculum		How to Read Tables	
Evidence-Based or Currently Used in Head Start Programs		Overall Table—Ratings for all Curricula for all Components	
Background	4	Individual Curriculum Tables—Description and Ratings	
Components of an Effective Language and Literacy Curriculum	4	Limitations	11
Overview		Curricula Reviews	12
Component 1: Curriculum is Evidence Based		Overall Table	
Component 2a/b: Curriculum Shows Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills		<i>Developing Talkers</i>	
Component 3a/b: Comprehensive across Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements		<i>Doors to Discovery</i>	
Component 4a/b: Depth for Each Covered Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element		<i>Literacy Express</i>	
Component 5a/b: Specific Learning Goals for Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills		<i>PAVEd for Success</i>	
Component 6a/b: Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills		<i>Read It Again-PreK!</i>	
Component 7: Responsive Teaching		<i>World of Words (WOW)</i>	
Component 8: Supports for Individualized Instruction		<i>Zoo-phonics® Multisensory Language Arts Program</i>	
Component 9: Culturally and Linguistically Responsive		References	48
Component 10a/b: Ongoing Assessments for Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills		Appendices	50
Component 11: Professional Development Opportunities		Appendix A: Details about the Review Process	
Component 12: Family Involvement Materials		Appendix B: Detailed Description of Included Tables	
		Appendix C: List of Curriculum Resources	
		Appendix D: Depth of Coverage for Domain Elements	
		Appendix E: List of Reports Examined	



INTRODUCTION

Purpose

The *Language and Literacy Preschool Curriculum Consumer Report* provides information and guidance for Head Start programs as they select curricula based on the strengths and needs of their participating children and teachers. The curricula reviewed in this report were rated for their implementation in center-based programs, and each includes elements designed to strengthen the teaching and learning of children's language and literacy skills. This report is intended to complement the *Curriculum Consumer Report*, which reviewed comprehensive curricula that covered multiple Head Start learning domains (including Language Development, Literacy Knowledge & Skills, Mathematics Knowledge & Skills, Social & Emotional Development). In this report, additional curricula are reviewed that focus on the domains of Language Development and/or Literacy Knowledge & Skills.

Programs should decide whether a domain specific curriculum might be needed in addition to their comprehensive curriculum. This decision is made based on whether or not school readiness goals and child outcome goals are being met. If they are, there may not be a need to add additional domain specific curricula. If goals are not being met, mainly in the areas of language and/or literacy, this *Language and Literacy Curriculum Consumer Report* can help programs choose a curriculum that best meets their needs. A language and/or literacy curriculum, paired with a comprehensive curriculum, could increase the number and quality of language and/or literacy activities that are being implemented.

Target Audience

This report is primarily designed for Head Start grantees, technical assistance providers, such as Early Childhood Education (ECE) specialists, preschool center directors, and others who are making decisions about curricula.

Overview of the Report

Included in this report are descriptions of 12 components of an effective language and literacy preschool curriculum; guidance on curriculum selection; and a set of ratings for 7 language and literacy curricula on the 12 components of an effective curriculum. The introductory material in this report provides information that is essential to interpreting the curriculum ratings and using the ratings to help make curricular decisions.



INCLUDED LANGUAGE AND LITERACY PRESCHOOL CURRICULA

Selection Criteria

A curriculum was considered for inclusion in this report if it addressed the Language Development and/or Literacy Knowledge & Skills learning domains in the Head Start Child Development and Early Learning Framework (HSCDELFF) and met the following inclusion criteria:

- The curriculum meets the definition of a curriculum, as defined by the *Head Start Program Performance Standards*.
- The curriculum's main emphasis includes explicit language and/or literacy instruction.
- The curriculum is commercially available, and curriculum materials were provided to the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning (NCQTL) by the publishers.

And at least one of the following:

- The curriculum is evidence-based, demonstrating a positive effect on any relevant child outcome on a research report or research review since January 2008 to June 2013.

OR

- The curriculum was used in at least five Head Start programs in 2011 and 2012, according to Program Information Report (PIR) data.

Definition of Curriculum

The *Head Start Program Performance Standards* define a curriculum as a written plan that includes the following: goals for development and learning; experiences for children to achieve these goals; roles for adults to help children in these experiences; and materials for curriculum implementation.

In this report, "language and literacy curriculum" was defined as a curriculum that addressed the Language Development and/or Literacy Knowledge & Skills learning domains as specified by HSCDELFF. These learning domains were addressed in an explicit way, and improving children's language and/or literacy skills were stated goals of the curriculum. For example, if a curriculum included reading books to

children, but did not specify targeted language and/or literacy goals, it was not considered a language and literacy curriculum. Our final list of curricula included domain-specific curricula, defined as those that primarily emphasized the language and/or literacy domains. It is important to note that some of these curricula also addressed other domains but language and/or literacy remained the primary focus (e.g., *Literacy Express*).

Availability of Curriculum

A key criterion of the review was that a curriculum must be commercially available to be considered for inclusion, either at no cost online or for purchase from a publisher. We therefore excluded curricula that were described as part of a research intervention study, but were not publicly available for consumers. After curricula were identified for review, we requested materials from publishers of curricula that were not fully available online. In most cases, publishers provided materials for our review.

Evidence-Based or Currently Used in Head Start Programs

It is important for a curriculum to be based on research-supported child development principles (National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning, 2010). For this review, more stringent criteria were required since numerous preschool language and literacy programs are commercially available. It was therefore imperative to narrow the review to include curricula that either: (a) demonstrate some evidence of promise of positive impacts on child outcomes, or (b) are currently used in at least five Head Start programs.

In our effort to identify language and literacy curricula that demonstrated some evidence of promise, searches of the existing literature were performed, with a focus on peer-reviewed research reports. Existing meta-analyses and reviews of the evidence conducted from January 2008 to June 2013 were also examined. These reports reviewed experimental and quasi-experimental studies and are listed in Appendix E. Relevant outcomes included any preschool language or literacy skill. If a peer-reviewed experimental or quasi-experimental study indicated a positive effect of a curriculum in any relevant outcome, the curriculum was included in this report.



BACKGROUND

The *Preschool Curriculum Consumer Report (2014)* rated comprehensive curricula on 13 components. Nine of the components were drawn from the document, *Choosing a Preschool Curriculum*. These include comprehensive domains of learning; specific learning goals; well-designed learning activities; responsive teaching; culturally and linguistically responsive teaching; individualized instruction; ongoing assessment; family involvement; and appropriateness for program staff, children, and families. In addition, the *Preschool Curriculum Consumer Report (2014)* also rated whether the curriculum is: grounded in child development principles, is evidence-based, has shown effects on child outcomes, and shows depth for each covered learning domain.

Since the focus of this report is on the Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills learning domains, the components focused on the comprehensiveness and depth specific to these domains. We also do not rate whether the curricula are grounded in sound child development principles as defined by Head Start, as those are more applicable to comprehensive curricula. The 12 components used to rate each curriculum are described in the following section.

COMPONENTS OF AN EFFECTIVE LANGUAGE AND LITERACY CURRICULUM

Overview

For this report, we considered the components of an effective curriculum in the context of the HSCDEL Language Development and Literacy Knowledge & Skills domains and domain elements.

Language Development

- **Receptive Language:** The ability to comprehend or understand language
- **Expressive Language:** The ability to use language

Literacy Knowledge & Skills

- **Book Appreciation:** The interest in books and their characteristics, and the ability to understand and get meaning from stories and information from books and other texts
- **Phonological Awareness:** An awareness that language can be broken into words, syllables, and smaller pieces of sound
- **Alphabet Knowledge:** The names and sounds associated with letters
- **Print Concepts & Conventions:** The concepts about print and early decoding (identifying letter-sound relationships)

- **Early Writing:** The familiarity with writing implements, conventions, and emerging skills to communicate through written representations, symbols, and letters

Component 1: Curriculum is Evidence Based

Rigorous studies, including randomized controlled trials, are needed to test the effectiveness of a curriculum. Multiple, diverse samples provide evidence that the curriculum is suited for many programs and children.

Questions for review:

- Has the curriculum been investigated in a preschool sample using a rigorous design (e.g., quasi-experimental, randomized control trial)?
- Are there studies that include measures of fidelity of implementation? Fidelity of implementation is the extent to which the curriculum is being implemented in the manner that was intended by the developers. Do the measures of fidelity indicate moderate to high levels of implementation?
- Has the curriculum been studied in more than one preschool sample? If so, do these samples allow the findings to be extended to diverse groups of children in terms of ethnicity/race and socioeconomic status (SES)?



Component 2a: Curriculum Shows Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development

Component 2b: Curriculum Shows Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills

The highest-quality research studies are completed independently from the curriculum publisher and are published in a peer-reviewed journal (Joseph & Strain, 2003) or by a large research organization (e.g., Westat, Child Trends, Mathematica). Rigorous studies (i.e., quasi-experimental, experimental designs)—which reflect a diverse or under-represented sample—provide evidence that the curriculum improves child outcomes.

Questions for review:

- What is the strength of the curriculum’s effect on child outcomes?
- How many studies indicated moderate effects on child outcomes?

Component 3a: Comprehensive across Language Development Domain Elements

Component 3b: Comprehensive across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements

Curricula that cover multiple domain elements within a particular domain are comprehensively addressing children’s skills within that domain. For the Language Development domain, a curriculum can address both domain elements including: Receptive Language and Expressive Language. For the Literacy Knowledge & Skills domain, a curriculum can address all of the domain elements: Book Appreciation, Phonological Awareness, Alphabet Knowledge, Print Concepts & Conventions, and Early Writing.

Questions for review:

- How many domain elements are covered by the curriculum?

Component 4a: Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element

Component 4b: Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element

The depth for each learning domain is made clear through an organized scope and sequence for each domain element, or a curricular map that identifies how the curriculum covers each domain element in a sequenced, progressive manner.

Questions for review:

- Does an organized scope exist that covers multiple skills within a particular domain element? (See Appendix D for a table summarizing depth of coverage of domain elements, across curricula).
- Is there an organized sequence for the learning domain element that links skills to individual learning activities?

Skills for Language Development Domain Elements:

- Receptive Language
 - Attend to language during conversations, songs, stories, or other learning experiences
 - Comprehend a wide variety of words
 - Comprehend different forms of language (questions/exclamations) or grammatical structures
 - Comprehend complex stories told in books or orally
- Expressive Language
 - Engage in extended conversations with peers and adults
 - Use a wide variety of words
 - Use different forms of language and grammatical structures
 - Engage in storytelling, including discussion of people, places, and things not immediately present



Skills for Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements:

- Book Appreciation
 - Show interest in shared reading experiences and looking at books independently
 - Recognize how books are read, such as front-to-back and one page at a time, and recognize basic characteristics, such as title, author, and illustrator
 - Demonstrate interest in different kinds of literature, such as fiction and non-fiction books and poetry, on a range of topics
 - Retell stories or information from books through conversation, artistic works, creative movement, or drama
- Phonological Awareness
 - Identify and produce rhyming words
 - Identify and produce words that begin with the same sound
 - Identify and discriminate between separate syllables in words
 - Identify and discriminate between individual sounds/phonemes in language
- Alphabet Knowledge
 - Recognize that the letters of the alphabet are a special category of visual graphics that can be individually named
 - Identify most uppercase letters (18 or more)
 - Identify most lowercase letters (15 or more)
 - Identify and produce the sounds associated with several letters

- Print Concepts & Conventions
 - Recognize print in everyday life, such as numbers, letters, one's name, words, and familiar logos and signs
 - Understand that print conveys meaning
 - Understand conventions, such as print moves from left to right and top to bottom of a page
 - Recognize words as a unit of print and understand that letters are grouped to form words
- Early Writing
 - Experiment with writing tools and materials
 - Recognize that writing is a way of communicating for a variety of purposes, such as giving information, sharing stories, or giving an opinion
 - Use scribbles, shapes, pictures, and letters to represent objects, stories, experiences, or ideas
 - Copy, trace, or independently write letters or words, including first name

Component 5a: Specific Learning Goals for Language Development

Component 5b: Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills

Clearly defined goals enable teachers and families to focus on what they are trying to accomplish and what skills are being measured. In addition, clear goals help establish alignment between the goals of the program and the goals of the curriculum, which leads to more cohesive and complete instruction.

Questions for review:

- Are there specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate goals for each learning activity?
- Is there alignment between the learning goals of the learning activity and the content within the learning activity?
- Is there alignment between learning goals for each learning activity and the



scope and sequence?

Component 6a: Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development

Component 6b: Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills

Effective programs and curricula include well-designed, engaging learning experiences that support specific learning goals and objectives (Chambers, Cheung, Slavin, Smith, & Laurenzano, 2010). Young children learn best with highly interactive, experiential learning activities (Chambers et al., 2010; Galinsky, 2006). Additionally, clear and well-designed activities prompt and encourage teachers to use various strategies and interactive materials to further engage children in learning and development.

Questions for review:

- Are the learning activities easy to follow, and do they follow a similar pattern across different activities?
- Are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation (e.g., guidelines for success or teacher's tips, list of materials for each activity, instructions for setting up the environment)?
- Does the curriculum prompt teachers to use multiple strategies and interactive materials?
- Is the purpose of the activity clear and meaningful?

Component 7: Responsive Teaching

The most effective curricula provide support to teachers to intentionally use responsive teaching, where teachers purposefully use a combination of child-focused and direct teaching strategies to make learning more appropriate to children's needs (Galinsky, 2006). Higher quality emotional and instructional teacher-child interactions have been linked to improvements in preschool children's academic and language skills (Mashburn et al., 2008).

Questions for review:

- Do the learning activities include both child-focused and teacher-directed strategies?
- Is support provided within learning activities for how to engage in high-quality

interactions with children?

Component 8: Supports for Individualized Instruction

Effective curricula address individual differences among children (Ramey & Ramey, 1992). By providing guidance in how to adapt activities, materials, and the learning environment for children with special needs, the curriculum facilitates accessibility to the learning activities for all children.

Questions for review:

- Do learning activities provide activity-specific support for children who are below as well as for children who are above cognitive or academic expectations?
- Are there guidelines on how to adapt learning activities for children with physical and/or emotional needs?
- Are there guidelines for ways to adapt the materials and/or environment to meet different levels of need?

Component 9: Culturally and Linguistically Responsive

The most effective curricula provide support so that teachers can be responsive to the cultural and linguistic needs of children, families, and communities (Galinsky, 2006). Children in preschool programs, in which teachers speak the children's home language, show better development of social skills (Chang et al., 2007). Programs that support both the development of English and of the children's home languages can help low-income children who are dual-language learners increase their proficiency in both languages (Winsler, Diaz, Espinosa, & Rodriguez, 1999).

Questions for review:

- Does the curriculum provide materials for use inside the classroom and for families in languages other than English?
- Do materials present diversity in terms of culture, ethnicity, gender, etc.? Are they incorporated throughout most learning activities?
- Is there guidance provided to teachers in how to assist dual-language learners?
- Is there guidance provided to teachers in how to adapt the learning activities to



meet a specific program's cultural and linguistic needs?

Component 10a: Ongoing Assessments for Language Development

Component 10b: Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills

The most effective programs and curricula include an ongoing assessment component (Barnett, 2008). Effective curricular assessments link to both the learning goals of the activities and to children's learning outcomes. In order to facilitate use and meaningfulness, assessments should be user-friendly and provide guidance for how teachers and programs analyze and interpret assessment data to help teachers tailor future instruction to increase children's learning and development (Galinsky, 2006). Additionally, evidence of validation provides support that the assessment is linked to child outcomes.

Questions for review:

- Are the assessments based on sound child development principles?
- Are the assessments aligned with learning goals covered in learning activities?
- Do the assessments measure children's skills on outcomes that are aligned with the HSCDELF?
- Are the assessments easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement?
- Does the curriculum provide support for how teachers should analyze and interpret assessment results, in order to adapt future learning activities?
- Is there research evidence that the assessments are linked to child outcomes?

Component 11: Professional Development Opportunities

Individualized consultation and regular feedback are most effective in improving preschool teachers' use of instructional strategies (Pianta, Mashburn, Downer, Hamre, & Justice, 2008). By offering professional development in a variety of ways, the curriculum can facilitate teachers and staff with both initial and ongoing training.

Questions for review:

- Does the curriculum provide comprehensive initial as well as ongoing training?
- Are there a variety of levels of individualization provided?
- Is professional development (PD) available for staff members other than teachers?
- Are there multiple modes (e.g., initial group, supplemental webinars) of PD that are available at different entry points (e.g., initial, ongoing, mastery)?
- Is there evidence that the PD supports have a positive change on a teacher's implementation practices?

Component 12: Family Involvement Materials

The most effective programs and curricula include strong family education and/or support components (Galinsky, 2006; Barnard, 2004). Incorporating families into the classroom is an essential part of engaging families in their children's learning. Materials provided to families suggest ways to extend classroom learning into the home.

Questions for review:

- Are materials provided for teachers to distribute to caregivers that review what children are learning in the classroom?
- Are strategies provided for families to review and extend learning outside of the classroom?
- Is guidance provided on how teachers can link learning goals to home?
- Are there suggestions for how to incorporate parent and family volunteers in the classroom?
- Are there suggestions for how to establish and maintain a positive family-teacher relationship?



PRIORITIZING COMPONENTS

No Curriculum Is Perfect

Each of the language and literacy curricula presented in this report has its strengths and weaknesses. We make no specific recommendations or endorsements for any of the curricula presented. No single curriculum will be the best fit for all programs. Prior to selecting a curriculum, individuals from the program need to assess the strengths and weaknesses of their program resources (e.g., staff, curriculum).

Strengths and Weaknesses of Your Program

Evaluating program strengths and weaknesses is an important step to take in order to choose a curriculum that best fits classroom needs. One suggestion is to create a curriculum-focused, self-assessment team that may include staff, families, policy group members, and community members. This team can assist in identifying areas that need improvement based on child outcome data. Component 1 (Curriculum is Evidence Based) and Component 2 (Curriculum Shows Effects on Child Outcomes) address whether rigorous research has been conducted on the curriculum, and whether there is evidence of impact of the curriculum on children's outcomes. Using this information, a program might select a curriculum where there is evidence of positive child outcomes in Language Development or Literacy Knowledge & Skills.

Another suggestion is to explore the resources available on the Early Childhood Learning and Knowledge Center (ECLKC) website that may help assess a program's current curriculum or curricula. See Appendix C for a list of resources.

Process of Prioritizing

Of the 12 components of an effective curriculum presented in this report, a program must prioritize which ones are more important according to the needs of the program. Here are two scenarios to consider:

- If a program has many teachers with little experience teaching preschool, one consideration might be to choose a curriculum that has a strong evidence base for supporting child outcomes (Component 2), clear organization of goals (Component 5), activities (Component 6), assessments (Component 10), and guided, prompted support for implementation. Extensive initial training and professional development opportunities should be available as well (Component 11).
- If a program's self-assessment suggests that children are getting a lot of exposure to Alphabet Knowledge, but not the other Literacy Knowledge & Skills domain elements, one consideration might be to choose a curriculum that shows comprehensiveness across domain elements (Component 3) and depth for each covered domain element (Component 4).

Some domain-specific language and literacy curricula are designed to encompass a large part of a school day while other curricula are designed to be brief. For example, *Read It Again-PreK!* is a 30-minute supplement that can provide targeted support to improve teaching and learning, while *Doors to Discovery* encompasses a larger part of a school day. Selection of a curriculum should be based on the assessed needs of the teaching and learning in a given program. For example, if a program identifies alphabet knowledge as being a particular instructional need, then an appropriate domain-specific curriculum would be one that systematically supports the teaching of letter-names and letter-sounds.



ENHANCING A CURRICULUM

Suggestions for Ways to Enhance a Curriculum to Meet the Needs of Your Program

After a program has decided on a curriculum or a set of curricula, the work is not yet complete. To meet the unique needs of the teachers, children, and families in a program, a curriculum needs to be enhanced to best fit these needs both at the beginning of the year and on an ongoing basis throughout the year. By enhancing a curriculum, the content or scope and sequence is not significantly altered, but rather it is tailored to meet the specific needs of the program. If a significant change is made, it may influence the outcomes a program is expecting. A curriculum can be enhanced to meet the needs of a specific program:

- Supplement the curriculum's set of picture books with books that reflect the diversity and languages spoken in your classroom.
- Look for high-quality language and literacy professional development opportunities to help teachers gain knowledge and expertise in these areas.
- Incorporate opportunities for teachers and teacher aides to plan together, to better support and facilitate small group language and literacy learning.
- Encourage teachers to plan together within the same age level and across different age levels. This helps to better align children's language and literacy experiences and support development across different ages.
- Enhance a curriculum to respond to the needs of children learning more than one language.

CURRICULA RATINGS

How to Read Tables

The curricula ratings are presented in two ways. The first is in an overall table, which includes ratings for all curricula across all components. The second is in individual curriculum tables, which include information about the curriculum, as well as ratings and a brief rationale for each rating. The language and literacy curricula are presented in alphabetical order in these tables. Numeric ratings from 1 to 4 were assigned. These were converted to star ratings.

Overall Table—Ratings for all Curricula for all Components

The overall table is set up with the 12 components of an effective curriculum listed in columns, and the curricula that have been reviewed listed (in alphabetical order) in rows. These tables provide the reader with an overview of ratings at a glance. Not applicable, or n/a, is marked on some components. This is the case if a curriculum addresses only language or only literacy. Where n/a is not marked, the curriculum addresses both language and literacy.

Individual Curriculum Tables—Description and Ratings

For each individual curriculum, there are two tables. The first table provides a general description of the curriculum, including target population, delivery format, cost per classroom, domain elements covered, training, and materials reviewed by raters. This table also indicates whether a specific domain element (e.g., Phonological Awareness) is covered with sufficient depth. If at least half of the skills for a particular domain element were covered (see skills listed in Component 4), this is indicated with a symbol next to the domain element. If at least half of the skills were not covered, this is indicated with a next to the domain element. See Appendix D for a table summarizing the depth of coverage of domain elements across curricula.

The second table includes the ratings for the curricula across the 12 components of an effective curriculum, as well as a brief rationale for each rating. For a more detailed description about the sections of each table, see Appendix B.



LIMITATIONS

This document contains a set of 12 components of an effective curriculum, as identified by a careful review of literature and in consultation with child development and early education specialists from NCQTL. Although we believe these components fully address what is necessary for inclusion in a high-quality, effective domain-specific curriculum, we make no claims that these are the only components of an effective curriculum. Systematic reviews of preschool curricula may use other criteria, sometimes more rigorous or more restricted. In our review, we sought to balance the need for a research-based curriculum with supporting evidence with other programmatic concerns, such as meeting the needs of enrolled children.

A diligent effort was made to ensure that all available and published curricula that met the inclusion requirements and were used by at least some Head Start programs were included in the report. Although a stringent and extensive review occurred for each curriculum (see Appendix A), ratings should be considered as only one factor in making a decision about a curriculum. Other factors included in the decision process may be cost, available materials, specific program needs, and familiarity with a curriculum.



For more information, contact us at: NCQTL@UW.EDU or 877-731-0764

This document was prepared under Grant #90HC0002 for the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Head Start, by the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning.

SUMMER 2015



Language and Literacy Curricula	Evidence-Based	Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development	Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills	Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements	Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements	Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element	Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element	Specific Learning Goals for Language Development	Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills	Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development	Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills	Responsive Teaching	Supports for Individualized Instruction	Culturally and Linguistically Responsive	Ongoing Assessments for Language Development	Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills	Professional Development Opportunities	Family Involvement Materials
<i>Developing Talkers</i>	★	★	n/a	★	n/a	★	n/a	★	n/a	★	n/a	★	☆	☆	★	n/a	★	☆
<i>Doors to Discovery</i>	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	☆	☆	☆	☆	★	★
<i>Literacy Express</i>	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	☆	★	★	★	★	★
<i>PAVEd for Success</i>	★	★	n/a	★	n/a	★	n/a	☆	n/a	★	n/a	★	☆	☆	☆	n/a	☆	★
<i>Read It Again-PreK!</i>	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	☆	☆	★	★	★	☆
<i>World of Words (WOW)</i>	★	★	n/a	★	n/a	★	n/a	☆	n/a	★	n/a	★	☆	☆	☆	n/a	☆	☆
<i>Zoo-phonics® Multisensory Language Arts Program</i>	☆	☆	☆	★	★	★	★	☆	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★	★

☆	★	★	★
No evidence	Minimal evidence	Some evidence	Solid, high-quality evidence



<h2>Developing Talkers</h2>	<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p><i>Developing Talkers</i> is a curricular supplement to promote oral language that follows a Pre-Kindergarten Response to Intervention instructional framework. The curriculum offers parallel English and Spanish versions designed to meet the needs of many aspects of Tier 1 and Tier 2 Pre-K oral language instruction. Specifically, listening comprehension and vocabulary skills are targeted in the book reading context by providing lessons, materials, and an instructional template to develop and strengthen children's oral language skills. Zucker, T. A., Cabell, S. Q., Solari, E. J., & Landry, S. H. (2010). <i>Developing talkers: Pre-K curricular supplement to promote oral language</i>. Houston, TX: University of Texas Health Science Center at Houston.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://texasschoolready.org/curriculum</p>
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>	<p>Delivery</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whole Group Instruction • Small Group Instruction • Learning Centers
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>Make your kits: Make your own kits by completing a short online training and downloading the materials at no cost. Teachers will be responsible for printing and assembling the kits.</p> <p>Order pre-made kits: University of Texas Print Services provides pre-made kits for \$550.00 in English and \$610.00 in Spanish.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://texasschoolready.org/curriculum</p>	<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language
<p>Training</p> <p>Some initial training is available at www.teachscape.com. Fee-based, customized in-person training offered.</p>	<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Early Writing
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p>Teacher Manual; Units 1–4 (each unit contains lesson plans and vocabulary cards); instructional stickers to attach to trade books</p>	

★	★	★	★
No evidence	Minimal evidence	Some evidence	Solid, high-quality evidence



DEVELOPING TALKERS

<p>Evidence-Based</p>		<p>At the time of the review, there was one study conducted on <i>Developing Talkers</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: <i>Developing Talkers</i> was investigated in a pilot study using an experimental design in which teachers were randomly assigned to a condition (Zucker, Solari, Landry, & Swank, 2013). • Curriculum Implementation: Zucker et al. (2013) reported that teachers implemented the Tier 1 curricular component with a moderate to high level of fidelity and the Tier 2 component with a low to moderate level of fidelity. • Replication/Generalization: <i>Developing Talkers</i> was studied in one sample, and sample demographics reflected ethnic/racial diversity, allowing the findings to be generalized to select groups.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: In a four-week experimental study, Zucker et al. (2013) found that children in the intervention group outperformed children in the control group, with a strong effect, on an experimenter-designed measure of curriculum-related receptive vocabulary ($d=0.81$). There were no significant differences on measures of vocabulary fluency, curriculum-related expressive vocabulary, or listening comprehension.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements</p>		<p>Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Developing Talkers</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.</p>
<p>Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>Developing Talkers</i> covers all four of the Receptive Language skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element, but the sequence is not linked to specific learning activities. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>Developing Talkers</i> covers all four of the Expressive Language skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element, but the sequence is not linked to specific learning activities.
<p>Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>



DEVELOPING TALKERS

<p>Specific Learning Goals for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Developing Talkers</i> identifies goals for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate. The scope and sequence document for each unit has the comprehension and vocabulary targets for the themes (each week) and those follow through to the individual activities on the lesson planner sheets. • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the goals of each learning activity and the individual activities within the learning activity. It is indicated which pieces of the activity meet which goals. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: There is evidence of alignment between the goals for each learning activity and the scope and sequence.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow an exact pattern across different activities. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation. For example, in each activity, there are instructions that are “step by step” with recommended scripts and a list of materials needed for the activity. • Variety: <i>Developing Talkers</i> prompts teachers to use multiple strategies, such as whole group, small group, and individual time, as well as interactive materials, such as acting out and drawing, to meet a wide variety of learning styles. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: The purpose of each activity is well defined and appears to be a meaningful part of the overall curriculum. For example, the teacher’s manual thoroughly discusses the purpose for the activities and the importance for children’s development.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: <i>Developing Talkers</i> offers both teacher-directed and child-focused strategies, and it provides room for incorporating children’s perspectives. For example, some of the extension activities are child-focused (e.g., children draw a picture and write or provide dictation about using their five senses). • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: <i>Developing Talkers</i> provides strong support regarding how to provide high-quality interactions that are embedded within learning activities.



DEVELOPING TALKERS

<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: Most learning activities provide activity-specific support for differentiation for children who are performing below cognitive or academic expectations. • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive/Academic Expectations: There are very limited guidelines for differentiation for children who are performing above cognitive or academic expectations. For example, there is a brief section on general tips on Page 12 of the Teacher’s Manual. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: No guidance is provided. • Material Adaptation: No guidance is provided. • Environment Adaptation: No guidance is provided.
<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: <i>Developing Talkers</i> provides materials in English only, although there is a separate, similar Spanish curriculum called <i>Hablemos Juntos</i>. • Materials Represent Diversity: While there are some trade books that reflect cultural diversity, most of the materials represent a single majority culture. • Support for Dual-Language Learners: While there is a guideline on Page 7 of the Teacher’s Manual on how to support dual-language learners, this is done in a general manner and is not activity-specific. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: <i>Developing Talkers</i> does not provide suggestions for how to adapt the instruction to meet a specific center’s cultural and linguistic needs.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: <i>Developing Talkers</i> provides assessments that align with learning goals covered in the activities. For example, the Vocabulary Curriculum Based Measure is used weekly and is directly linked to the vocabulary taught during the week, and the Pre-K Language Curriculum Based Measure is used monthly at the end of each unit and includes teacher ratings of all instructional objectives addressed explicitly and implicitly in <i>Developing Talkers</i>. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: The assessments measure children’s skills on outcomes that are fully aligned with the Language Development domain of the <i>Head Start Child Development and Early Learning Framework</i>. • Using Assessment Information: While <i>Developing Talkers</i> provides support for how to reflect on assessment results, there is no specific support provided on how to adapt for future instruction. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The assessments are easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence that the assessments have been validated or linked to positive learning outcomes.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>



DEVELOPING TALKERS

<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: There is a minimal initial training provided via www.teachscape.com. There is a single section called the “Introduction to Developing Talkers” that can be accessed free of charge on www.teachscape.com which all teachers must complete before they can access Developing Talkers materials online. A fee-based, in-person workshop is also available as indicated on the curriculum’s website (texasschoolready.org/curriculum). • Continued Professional Development: Continued professional development is offered for a fee, but specific information regarding its content was unavailable for review. • Level of Individualization: Fee-based training is customizable, but specific information regarding its content was unavailable for review. • Other Program Staff: Fee-based training can be customized for literacy leaders and coaches. • Multiple Modes: <i>Developing Talkers</i> provides professional development online via www.teachscape.com. Fee-based, in-person workshops are also available. • Evidence of Validation: There is no evidence that the professional development has been validated or linked to improved teacher practices.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: No materials are provided. • Teacher Guidance: No guidance is provided. • Incorporating Family Volunteers: No guidance is provided. • Parent-Teacher Relationships: No guidance is provided.



<h2>Doors to Discovery</h2>	<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p><i>Doors to Discovery</i> is a pre-kindergarten program that builds a foundation of oral language, phonological awareness, alphabet knowledge, and concepts of print and a love of books. Literacy enriched learning centers provide a child-centered approach throughout the curriculum.</p> <p>McGraw-Hill Education (2002). <i>Doors to Discovery</i>.</p> <p>Retrieved from: https://www.mheonline.com/program/view/5/7/407/0076036243/</p>
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>	<p>Delivery</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whole Group Instruction • Small Group Instruction • Learning Centers
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>Doors to Discovery Explorations Grade Pre-K Complete Set: \$2,870.85</p> <p>Retrieved from: https://www.mheonline.com/program/view/5/7/407/0076036243/</p>	<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language
<p>Training</p> <p>Initial training; ongoing professional development including site visits; administrator seminars (No prices are listed on website, and it is unclear whether all training is specific to the curriculum or more general in nature.)</p>	<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Early Writing
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p>8 explorations that each include a Discovery Guide, big books, lap books, scrapbook, posters, story character props, activity cards, word cards, CD, exploration-at-a-glance planner, and consumable books (New Places, New Faces; Vroom! Vroom!; Tabby Tiger’s Diner; Build it Big!; Healthy Me!; Discovery Street; Our Water Wonderland; Backyard Detectives)</p>	

★	★	★	★
No evidence	Minimal evidence	Some evidence	Solid, high-quality evidence



DOORS TO DISCOVERY

<p>Evidence-Based</p>		<p>At the time of the review, there were three studies conducted on <i>Doors to Discovery</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> has been investigated using an experimental design (Assel, Landry, Swank, & Gunnewig, 2007; Han, Roskos, Christie, Mandzuk, & Vukelich, 2005; Preschool Curriculum Evaluation Research, 2008). • Curriculum Implementation: Assel et al. (2007) reported that teachers implemented the curriculum with a high level of fidelity. • Replication/Generalization: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> has been studied in multiple samples, and at least one study was conducted in which the investigator was not the curriculum developer (Assel et al., 2007; PCER, 2008). Sample demographics allow the findings to be generalized to diverse groups of children in terms of ethnicity/race and socioeconomic status.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: In an experimental study, Assel et al. (2007) reported small to moderate effects on children’s expressive vocabulary (Expressive Vocabulary Test) and small effects on complex language understanding ($d = 0.18$; Preschool Language Scale-IV Auditory Comprehension subtest).
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: Assel et al. (2007) reported small effects on children’s print knowledge (Woodcock-Johnson III Tests of Achievement Letter Word Identification subtest) and phonological awareness (Developing Skills Checklist Auditory subscale; Woodcock-Johnson III Tests of Achievement Sound Awareness/Rhyming subtest).
<p>Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.
<p>Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> covers all five domain elements throughout the curriculum: Book Appreciation & Knowledge, Phonological Awareness, Alphabet Knowledge, Print Concepts & Conventions, and Early Writing.
<p>Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> covers all four of the Receptive Language skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. It appears that each unit stands alone and may be used in any order. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> covers three of the four Expressive Language skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. It appears that each unit stands alone and may be used in any order. <i>Doors to Discovery</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Use different forms of language and grammatical structures.



DOORS TO DISCOVERY

<p>Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Book Appreciation & Knowledge: Doors to Discovery</i> covers all four of the Book Appreciation & Knowledge skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Phonological Awareness: Doors to Discovery</i> covers three of the four Phonological Awareness skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. <i>Doors to Discovery</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Identify and discriminate between individual sounds/phonemes in language. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Alphabet Knowledge: Doors to Discovery</i> covers one of the four Alphabet Knowledge skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. Although some letters are taught explicitly, <i>Doors to Discovery</i> does not fully address the following skills: Identify most uppercase letters (18 or more); identify most lowercase letters (18 or more); and identify and produce the sounds associated with several letters. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Print Concepts & Conventions: Doors to Discovery</i> covers three of the four Print Concepts & Conventions skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. <i>Doors to Discovery</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Recognize words as a unit of print and understand that letters are grouped to form words. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Early Writing: Doors to Discovery</i> covers all four of the Early Writing skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> identifies goals for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate (e.g., “Taking Turns and Engaging in Conversation”). • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals and the learning activity; however, the pieces of the activity are not labeled to match the components of the goals. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: No scope and sequence document provided.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> specifies goals for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate (e.g., “Noticing beginning letters in printed words”). • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals and the learning activity; however, the pieces of the activity are not labeled to match the components of the goals. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: No scope and sequence document is provided.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow an exact pattern across different learning activities. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate the implementation. For example, each activity includes teacher articles, materials needed, instructions for setting up the classroom areas, tips for Dual Language Learners, and strategies for teachers to incorporate before, during, and after the activity. • Variety: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> prompts teachers to use multiple strategies. For example, each theme kit within the curriculum includes a Discovery Guide with suggested activities for small group, whole group, centers, and activities for transitions. <i>Doors to Discovery</i> also encourages teachers to use several interactive materials to meet a wide variety of learning styles. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides a separate section that describes the purpose and the importance of learning goals for children’s growth. For example, each Discovery Guide includes a “Welcome” section that discusses the goals and research-based information about the curriculum.



DOORS TO DISCOVERY

<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow an exact pattern across different learning activities. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate the implementation. For example, each activity includes teacher articles, materials needed, instructions for setting up the classroom areas, tips for Dual Language Learners, and prompts for teachers to do before, during, and after the activity. • Variety: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> prompts teachers to use multiple strategies. For example, each theme kit within <i>Doors to Discovery</i> includes a Discovery Guide with suggested activities for small group, whole group, centers, and activities for transitions. <i>Doors to Discovery</i> also encourages teachers to use several interactive materials to meet a wide variety of learning styles. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides a separate section that describes the purpose and the importance of learning goals for children’s growth. For example, each Discovery Guide includes a “Welcome” section that discusses the goals and research-based information about the curriculum.
<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: Within this curriculum, there is a presence of both teacher-directed and child-focused activities, and children’s perspectives are included. Most of the child-focused activities occur within center activities where children spend time exploring materials and choosing what they are to do (e.g., post office center). Freedom of movement and student expression is evident throughout the curriculum. • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: Brief guidelines for high-quality interactions are provided in the Get Ready section of the Discovery Guides. Suggestions are provided for classroom management and organization, how to conduct class meetings, and various transition activities.
<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides some general support for differentiation for children who are below cognitive or academic expectations; however, this support is not specific to each learning activity. For example, there is a general section on children with special needs in each Discovery Guide that discusses cognitive delays. • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive Expectations: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides some general support for differentiation for children who are above cognitive or academic expectations; however, this support is not consistently provided in each learning activity. For example, a few activities include step-by-step instructions “For Older Children” (Pages 46, 60, 61 of Vroom! Vroom! Discovery Guide); however, these guidelines are not provided for all activities. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides some general support for differentiation for children who have physical and/or emotional needs; however, this support is not specific to each learning activity. • Material Adaptation: There are minimal guidelines provided for how to adapt the materials to meet the different levels of need. These guidelines are broad, and not specific to each learning activity.
<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> only provides materials in English. • Materials Represent Diversity: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides multiple materials that represent diversity in terms of ethnicity, gender, etc.; however, guidance is not provided in selection of classroom materials to respond to the diversity within the center. • Support for Dual-Language Learners: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides high-quality guidance and specific strategies for how English-speaking teachers can communicate with children who speak languages other than English. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides high-quality suggestions for how to adapt the instruction to meet a specific center’s cultural and linguistic needs; however, this support is not specific to each learning activity.



DOORS TO DISCOVERY

<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: There is some evidence of alignment between the assessments and the learning activities; however, this alignment is not clear. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: There is some evidence of alignment between the assessments and the Language Development domain on the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework; however, this alignment is not clear. • Using Assessment Information: There is minimal instruction provided for a teacher to reflect on assessment information. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The questions on the assessments are easy to understand. • Validated Assessments: There is evidence provided that the assessments are based on sound child development principles; however, the assessments are not validated and linked to children’s learning outcomes.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: There is some evidence of alignment between the assessments and the learning activities; however, this alignment is not clear. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: There is some evidence of alignment between the assessments and the Literacy Knowledge & Skills domain on the <i>Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework</i>; however, this alignment is not clear. • Using Assessment Information: There is minimal instruction provided for a teacher to reflect on assessment information. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The questions on the assessments are easy to understand. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence that the assessments have been validated or linked to positive learning outcomes.
<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides initial training that addresses the needs of individual teachers, classroom management, and assessment. • Continued Professional Development: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides ongoing professional development opportunities beyond the initial training. • Level of Individualization: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides a moderate level of individualization based upon the needs of the teacher and/or program. • Other Program Staff: Paraprofessionals, administrators, and parents are encouraged to participate in trainings. • Multiple Modes: <i>Doors to Discovery</i> provides multiple modes of training, including workshops, ongoing follow-up and support, and stakeholder seminars. • Evidence of Validation: There is no evidence that the professional development has been validated or linked to improved teacher practices.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: Family letters are provided for teachers to distribute to caregivers that review and extend what children are learning in the classroom (e.g., pp. 151–158 in <i>Vroom! Vroom! Discovery Guide</i>). • Teacher Guidance: Guidance is provided to teachers on how to link learning goals to home in a meaningful way (e.g., p. 47 in <i>New Places, New Faces Discovery Guide</i> contains lesson-specific Home Connection tips). Articles about family literacy are included in each unit. • Incorporating Family Volunteers: No guidance is provided. • Parent-Teacher Relationships: No guidance is provided.



<h2>Literacy Express</h2>		<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p><i>Literacy Express</i> is a supplemental curriculum promoting oral language skills, phonological awareness, print knowledge, and more. The theme-based curriculum kit is packed with hands-on tools and manipulatives. With a focus on dialogic reading, <i>Literacy Express</i> also contains a library of over 60 children’s books.</p> <p>Lonigan, C. J., Clancey-Menchetti, J., Phillips, B. M., McDowell, K., & Farver, J. M. (2005). <i>Literacy Express: A preschool curriculum</i>. Tallahassee, FL: <i>Literacy Express</i>.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://www.lakeshorelearning.com/product/productDet.jsp?productItemID=1%2C689%2C949%2C371%2C920%2C742&ASSORTMENT%3C%3East_id=1408474395181113&bmUID=1393439416051</p>	
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>		<p>Delivery</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whole Group Instruction • Small Group Instruction • Learning Centers 	
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>Literacy Express Curriculum Kit: \$547.69 Literacy Express Classroom Library: \$677.65 Curriculum Guides are available separately but pricing is not included on the website. Retrieved from: http://www.lakeshorelearning.com/product/productDet.jsp?productItemID=1%2C689%2C949%2C371%2C920%2C742&ASSORTMENT%3C%3East_id=1408474395181113&bmUID=1393439416051</p>		<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language 	
<p>Training</p> <p>Initial training \$2600; additional professional development modules available for an additional fee (customizable to meet program needs)</p>		<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Early Writing 	
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p>Literacy Express Curriculum Kit—including Teacher’s Guide, Teacher Training and Planning Guide, Guide for Directors and Mentors, Lesson Plan and Scheduling Forms, 10 Thematic Unit Instructional Guides, Off to Kindergarten Instructional Guide, Parent ABC’s, Curriculum-Linked Assessment Forms</p>			
★	★	★	★
No evidence	Minimal evidence	Some evidence	Solid, high-quality evidence



LITERACY EXPRESS

<p>Evidence-Based</p>		<p>At the time of the review, there were three studies conducted on <i>Literacy Express</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: <i>Literacy Express</i> was investigated using an experimental design in which centers or children were randomly assigned to a condition (Farver, Lonigan, & Eppe, 2009; Lonigan, Farver, Phillips, & Clancy-Menchetti, 2011; PCER, 2008). • Curriculum Implementation: Farver et al. (2009) reported that trainers implemented the program with a high level of fidelity. • Replication/Generalization: <i>Literacy Express</i> was studied in multiple samples, and sample demographics reflected ethnic/racial diversity, allowing the findings to be generalized to select groups.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: In an experimental study of Spanish-speaking children, Farver et al. (2009) reported that children exposed to the English-only curriculum outperformed children in the control group with moderate effects on phonological awareness ($d = 0.47$, 0.63 for Blending and Elision, respectively) and small to moderate effects on print knowledge ($d = 0.41$), as measured by the P-CTOPP. In an experimental study, Lonigan et al. (2011) reported that children exposed to the curriculum outperformed children in the control group with a small to moderate effect on phonological awareness ($d = 0.36$, Elision) and print knowledge ($d = 0.32$), as measured by the P-CTOPP.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: Assel et al. (2007) reported small effects on children’s print knowledge (Woodcock-Johnson III Tests of Achievement Letter Word Identification subtest) and phonological awareness (Developing Skills Checklist Auditory subscale; Woodcock-Johnson III Tests of Achievement Sound Awareness/Rhyming subtest).
<p>Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Literacy Express</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.
<p>Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Literacy Express</i> covers all five domain elements throughout the curriculum: Book Appreciation & Knowledge, Phonological Awareness, Alphabet Knowledge, Print Concepts & Conventions, and Early Writing.
<p>Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>Literacy Express</i> covers all four of the Receptive Language skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element that is linked to specific learning activities. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>Literacy Express</i> covers all four of the Expressive Language skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element that is linked to specific learning activities.



LITERACY EXPRESS

<p>Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Book Appreciation & Knowledge: Literacy Express</i> covers three of the four Book Appreciation & Knowledge skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. <i>Literacy Express</i> primarily utilizes fictional storybooks and does not consistently address the following skill: Demonstrate interest in different kinds of literature, such as fiction and non-fiction books and poetry, on a range of topics. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Phonological Awareness: Literacy Express</i> covers three of the four Phonological Awareness skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element. <i>Literacy Express</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Identify and discriminate between individual sounds/phonemes in language. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Alphabet Knowledge: Literacy Express</i> covers all four of the Alphabet Knowledge skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Print Concepts & Conventions: Literacy Express</i> covers three of the four Print Concepts & Conventions skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. <i>Literacy Express</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Recognize words as a unit of print and understand that letters are grouped to form words. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Early Writing: Literacy Express</i> covers two of the four Early Writing skills, but the instructional sequence is vague for this domain element. The following skills are not consistently addressed: Use scribbles, shapes, pictures, and letters to represent objects, stories, experiences, or ideas; copy, trace, or independently write letters or words, including first name.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Literacy Express</i> specifies goals or targeted skills for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate. For example, one goal for Thematic Unit 8—Bugs and Insects is, “The children will learn to use new vocabulary while talking about the story plot or their own personal experiences as opposed to just the pictures in the storybook.” The corresponding goals for the specific activity are, “to reinforce newly acquired vocabulary, to link the vocabulary with the story plot and personal experience, and to gain verbal fluency with new vocabulary.” (See Pages 4 and 8 in Thematic Unit 8—Bugs and Insects.) • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals of each activity and the components within each activity. It is indicated which pieces of the activity meet which goals. This connection is established through the purpose statement that accompanies each learning activity. An example can be found on page 8 of Thematic Unit 8. The purpose statement here is “... children are asked questions that require them to relate personally to the picture or story. Children are encouraged to use and improve their expressive language skills through a series of prompts and questions that are increasingly challenging with each repetition of the book.” • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: The scope and sequence is clearly laid out, and alignment exists with regard to the dialogic reading portion of the plan; however, this alignment is at the unit level and not activity specific.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Literacy Express</i> specifies goals or targeted skills for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate. For example, one goal for Thematic Unit 8—Bugs and Insects is, “The children will increase their understanding of how an individual phoneme affects words by learning to identify the onset and the rime unit of common words,” which identifies a corresponding targeted skill. (See pages 4 and 10 in Thematic Unit 8—Bugs and Insects.) • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals of each activity and the components within each activity. It is indicated which pieces of the activity meet which goals. This connection is established through the purpose statement that accompanies each learning activity. An example can be found on page 10 of Thematic Unit 8. The purpose statement here is, “To continue instruction in Phonological Awareness. By removing the first sound in a word the children will increase their level of understanding of how an individual phoneme affects a word.” • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: The scope and sequence is clearly laid out, and alignment exists with regard to the literacy portion of the plan; however, this alignment is at the unit-level and not activity specific.



LITERACY EXPRESS

<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities for the Language Development domain are logical and follow a similar pattern across different activities. For example, there is only one template for each unit for dialogic reading that is intended to be repeated over many different books. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation of the Dialogic Reading portion of the activity. The <i>Literacy Express</i> manual presents ways to set up the environment and additional support guidelines. A separate training guide provides lesson plan templates, sample schedules, and implementation forms. In addition, all necessary materials for the activity are listed at the beginning of each Thematic Unit Teacher’s Guide. • Variety: This curriculum relies on one teaching modality for the Language Development domain. Dialogic Reading is the main method of instruction to cover these domain elements. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: The purpose of the learning activities for the Language Development domain is well defined and appears to be a meaningful part of the overall curriculum. A purpose is listed for each learning activity (see Page 8 in the Thematic Unit 8 Teacher’s Guide).
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities for the Literacy Knowledge & Skills domain are logical and follow a similar pattern across different activities. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation of the literacy portion of the activity. The curriculum manual presents ways to set up the environment and additional support guidelines. A separate training guide provides lesson plan templates, sample schedules, and implementation forms. In addition, all necessary materials for the activity are listed at the beginning of each Thematic Unit Teacher’s Guide. • Variety: <i>Literacy Express</i> prompts teachers to use multiple strategies (e.g., small group, large group, center activities, and interactive materials) and various materials (e.g., picture cards, objects, songs, and puppets) to meet a wide variety of learning styles (see Pages 15–18 in the Thematic Unit 8 Teacher’s Guide). • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: The purpose of the learning activities for the Literacy Knowledge & Skills domain is well defined and appears to be a meaningful part of the overall curriculum. A purpose is listed for each learning activity (see page 16 in the Thematic Unit 8 Teacher’s Guide).
<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides both teacher-directed and child-focused strategies. Each unit includes many suggestions for center activities. • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: There is modest evidence for support in providing high-quality interactions in a separate manual (see Pages 14–18 in the Comprehensive Preschool Curriculum manual). There are also sections that discuss classroom management (pp. 34–38), structuring the classroom (pp. 39–45), and scheduling and organization (pp. 51–67).



LITERACY EXPRESS

<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: There are some general supports provided for children who are performing below expected cognitive or academic expectations. For example, pages 43 to 50 of the Literacy Express Teacher Training and Planning Guide offer a list of accommodations and modifications for children with “mild to moderate disabilities.” • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive/Academic Expectations: There are some general supports provided for children who are performing above expected cognitive or academic expectations; however, this support is not consistently provided across learning activities. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: There are some general guidelines provided for children who have physical and/or emotional needs; however, these guidelines are not activity specific. • Material Adaptation: There are minimal guidelines provided for how to adapt the materials to meet different levels of need (see pages 49–51 of the Literacy Express Teacher Training and Planning Guide). • Environment Adaptation: There are minimal guidelines provided for how to structure the classroom (see pages 46–50 in the Comprehensive Preschool Curriculum manual).
<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides parallel materials in Spanish that reinforce children’s literacy learning. • Materials Represent Diversity: Most of the materials represent a single, majority culture. For example, the dialogic reading books offer little ethnic diversity (e.g., <i>The Rain Came Down</i> and <i>To Market to Market</i> from Thematic Unit 3 and <i>Mama Zooms</i> from Thematic Unit 7). • Support for Dual-Language Learners: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides some prompts for teachers to support dual-language learners. For example, there are different materials that are provided in Spanish and English for code-related skill development, such as phonological awareness and print knowledge. The curriculum recommends that once children have some mastery over materials in Spanish, they will receive a parallel sequence in English. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: No guidance is provided.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: There is evidence that the assessments align with learning goals covered in learning activities. The Student Progress Tracking Sheet lists the targeted skills for Language Development (See the assessment section of Thematic Unit 8). • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: The assessments partially align with the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework. For example, the assessments address vocabulary (Expressive Language), but not Receptive Language. • Using Assessment Information: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides support for how to reflect on assessment results in order to adapt future learning activities. For example, pages 36–38 of the Literacy Express Teacher’s Guide discuss how to apply the information from the language assessments, and pages 56–59 provide detailed examples regarding how to use the assessments to adapt instruction. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The assessments are easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. All necessary assessment materials and forms are provided at the end of each thematic unit. The directions are presented clearly on each portion of the assessments. • Validated Assessments: The assessments are based on sound child development principles; however, there is no evidence that they have been validated and linked to children’s learning outcomes.



LITERACY EXPRESS

<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: There is evidence that the assessments align with learning goals covered in learning activities. The Student Progress Tracking Sheet lists the targeted skills for Literacy Knowledge & Skills (See the assessment section of Thematic Unit 8). • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: The assessments partially align with the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework. For example, the assessments address Phonological Awareness and Alphabet Knowledge, but not Early Writing. • Using Assessment Information: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides support for how to reflect on assessment results in order to adapt future learning activities. For example, pages 36–38 of the Literacy Express Teacher’s Guide discuss how to apply the information from the literacy assessments, and pages 56-59 provide detailed examples regarding how to use the assessments to adapt instruction. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The assessments are easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. All necessary assessment materials and forms are provided at the end of each thematic unit. The directions are presented clearly on each portion of the assessments. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence that the assessments have been validated or linked to positive learning outcomes.
<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides a 1½ day comprehensive initial training to teachers that provides in-depth content related to implementing the curriculum. • Continued Professional Development: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides comprehensive, ongoing professional development opportunities for an additional fee. There are multiple modules to choose from. • Level of Individualization: This curriculum provides moderate levels of individualization. For example, there is a menu of training modules to choose from, but all training appears to be in a whole group. • Other Program Staff: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides professional development for other staff members for an extra fee, but there is no modified content. • Multiple Modes: There are multiple modes of delivery, including in-person, webinars, PowerPoint presentations, and printed materials. • Evidence of Validation: There is no evidence that the professional development has been validated or linked to improved teacher practices.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: Materials are provided for teachers to distribute to caregivers that review what children are learning in the classroom and provide strategies for families to review/extend learning outside of the classroom (e.g., see appendices in thematic Unit 3 – Rhyme). • Teacher Guidance: Guidance is provided for teachers on how to link learning goals to home, but in a general format (see pp. 25–27 in the Comprehensive Preschool Curriculum Guide). Here teachers can read about various outreach ideas that may be suitable for their particular centers. • Incorporating Family Volunteers: Suggestions are provided for teachers for how to use parent and family volunteers in a more general way (see pp. 25–27 in the Comprehensive Preschool Curriculum Guide). Here teachers are encouraged to demonstrate Dialogic Reading for parents and provide suggestions for how the parents can implement the strategy at home. • Parent-Teacher Relationships: <i>Literacy Express</i> provides some suggestions for how to establish parent-teacher relationships, but it does not instruct teachers on how to maintain the relationship throughout the year (see pp. 25–27 in the Comprehensive Preschool Curriculum Guide).



<h2>PAVEd for Success</h2>	<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p><i>PAVEd for Success</i> is a curricular supplement that helps early childhood educators explicitly teach vocabulary and oral language skills through lessons that introduce key social studies and science terms. Shared storybook reading, intentional conversations, and explicit vocabulary instruction are features of this curriculum.</p> <p>Hamilton, C. & Schwanenflugel, P. (2011). <i>PAVEd for success: Building vocabulary and language development in young learners</i>. Baltimore, MD: Paul H. Brookes Publishing Co., Inc.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://products.brookespublishing.com/PAVEd-for-Success-P250.aspx</p>
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>	<p>Delivery</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whole Group Instruction • Small Group Instruction • Learning Centers
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>PAVEd for Success: Building Vocabulary and Language Development in Young Learners (includes a CD-ROM with printable materials) \$39.95</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://products.brookespublishing.com/PAVEd-for-Success-P250.aspx</p>	<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language
<p>Training</p> <p>No training is provided.</p>	<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input type="checkbox"/> Early Writing
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p>PAVEd for Success: Building Vocabulary and Language Development in Young Learners</p>	

<p>No evidence</p>	<p>Minimal evidence</p>	<p>Some evidence</p>	<p>Solid, high-quality evidence</p>



PAVED FOR SUCCESS

Evidence-Based		<p>At the time of the review, there was one study conducted on PAVEd for Success.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: <i>PAVED for Success</i> was investigated using a quasi-experimental design (Schwanenflugel et al., 2010). • Curriculum Implementation: Schwanenflugel et al. (2010) reported that teachers implemented the curriculum with a moderate level of fidelity. • Replication/Generalization: PAVEd for Success was studied in one sample, and sample demographics allow the findings to be generalized to select groups.
Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: In a quasi-experimental, 15-week study, Schwanenflugel et al. (2010) reported that children in the experimental vocabulary enhancement group outperformed children in the control group, with a small effect, on expressive vocabulary (effect size = 0.25), as measured by the Expressive Vocabulary Test (EVT). There was not a significant difference on children’s receptive vocabulary, as measured by the Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test (PPVT).
Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills	n/a	This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.
Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>PAVED for Success</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.
Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements	n/a	This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component
Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>PAVED for Success</i> covers all four of the Receptive Language skills, but does not have an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>PAVED for Success</i> covers all four of the Expressive Language skills, but does not have an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element.
Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element	n/a	This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component
Specific Learning Goals for Language Development		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>PAVED for Success</i> provides a chapter in the book that gives information about the goals behind each type of activity; however, there is no specific learning goal within each activity. • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is no alignment between the goals and the activities, because there is no specific goal within each activity. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: There is no alignment between the goals and the scope and sequence, because there is no specific goal within each activity.



PAVED FOR SUCCESS

<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow a similar pattern across different activities. For example, each unit begins with new vocabulary instruction, followed by a read aloud, which supports the use of the new vocabulary. There are extension activities included within each learning activity, which provide ample opportunities for children to interact with the new vocabulary. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation. For example, there are clear directions that are easy for teachers to follow, as well as a CD-ROM with pictures of vocabulary words for each lesson. • Variety: While the extension activities offer opportunities for teachers to use different modalities, teaching strategies, and materials, the main learning activities primarily rely on only one teaching strategy (e.g., whole group) and the activities are mostly teacher directed. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: The purpose of each learning activity is described in the first few chapters of the book, which also includes information on why it is important to teach certain skills to children. However, there is no purpose stated within each learning activity.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: <i>PAVED for Success</i> has both teacher-directed and child-focused strategies. Each book reading and vocabulary lesson is accompanied by extension activity ideas that often include regard for students’ perspectives. For example, children are invited to create their own bug stories (pp. 64–65 of Unit 2 Bug Helpers) and their own gardens (pp. 79–83, Unit 5 Gardening). • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: <i>PAVED for Success</i> includes guidelines in a separate portion of the manual (pp. 12–14) that provide support for teachers on how to interact with children during lessons. Here teachers learn basic tips for responsiveness and student expression. Questions that teachers can ask students are also embedded within lessons that help students with analysis and reasoning.
<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: While <i>PAVED for Success</i> gives some general guidelines for children who are performing below cognitive or academic expectations, these guidelines are not specific to each learning activity. For example, Chapter 7, titled “Supporting the Needs of Diverse Learners,” provides general information about English Language Learners and children with special needs. It describes ideas for possible accommodations, such as changing the time of conversations to when children are more comfortable, reading Spanish versions of books, and using flannel boards during reading. • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive/Academic Expectations: No guidance is provided. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: No guidance is provided. • Material Adaptation: There is minimal guidance provided for how to adapt materials to meet different levels of need. The majority of these recommendations are for the read-aloud portion of the units (see Chapter 7, pp. 52–53). • Environment Adaptation: There is minimal guidance provided for how to adapt the environment to meet different levels of need (e.g., read in smaller groups or in more cozy areas, schedule conversations as part of mealtimes or play activities, so children feel more comfortable and have more to talk about or create more play activities to work on the new skills).



PAVED FOR SUCCESS

<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: <i>PAVED for Success</i> provides materials in English only. Some of the books are available in Spanish versions; however, these need to be purchased separately. • Materials Represent Diversity: Most of the materials provided represent a single majority culture, but occasionally, materials are incorporated that represent diversity. For example, some of the books for the read-aloud selections (e.g., <i>Ben’s Trumpet</i> and <i>When I Grow Up</i>) represent the non-majority culture. • Support for Dual-Language Learners: There is guidance provided for how to assist dual-language learners (DLLs), however, these guidelines are broader, and not activity-specific. For example, Chapter 7 provides a section on “Supporting the Needs of Diverse Learners” that gives guidance on how to assist DLLs, such as reading books in Spanish in small group sessions, providing children with audio versions of the books, etc. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: No guidance is provided.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: <i>PAVED for Success</i> provides several forms to track teachers’ use of the strategies; however, there is only one assessment provided to track children’s progress. The assessment provided is a form to track children’s spontaneous use of vocabulary words during the extension activities, and it is not aligned with the learning activities. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: The assessment only addresses expressive language skills; there are no tools to assess receptive language skills. • Using Assessment Information: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide instructions for teachers on how to use the assessment information. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The assessment is easily accessible and user-friendly. For example, teachers write down the children’s names and then record the frequency with which children use new vocabulary. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence that the assessments have been validated or linked to positive learning outcomes.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide professional development materials. • Continued Professional Development: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide professional development materials. • Level of Individualization: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide professional development materials. • Other Program Staff: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide professional development materials. • Multiple Modes: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide professional development materials. • Evidence of Validation: <i>PAVED for Success</i> does not provide professional development materials.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: Parent newsletters are provided for each unit. These newsletters list the vocabulary and child-friendly definitions that children will encounter in the unit. Parents are encouraged to point out examples of the words at home and in the community. • Teacher Guidance: <i>PPAVED for Success</i> provides guidance to teachers on how to link learning goals to home in a more general format (Page 36). • Incorporating Family Volunteers in Classroom: <i>PAVED for Success</i> provides suggestions for how to use parent and family volunteers in the classroom in a general way and how to recruit family volunteers (page 36). • Parent-Teacher Relationships: <i>PAVED for Success</i> mentions the importance of parent-teacher relationships, but does not provide specific instructions about ways to establish or maintain these relationships. The manual discusses the importance of home-school collaboration (Page 36).



<h2>Read It Again-PreK!</h2>	<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p><i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> is a curricular supplement designed to develop and strengthen young children’s early foundations in language and literacy. It needs few materials for implementation and all lesson plans and implementation notes can be downloaded at no cost from the Internet. It is designed to be a 30-minute supplement, administered two to four times per week.</p> <p>Justice, L. M., & McGinty, A. S. (2009). <i>Read it again-PreK! A preschool curriculum supplement to promote language and literacy foundations</i>. Columbus, OH: The Ohio State University.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://ccec.ehe.osu.edu/practice/ccec-curricula/read-it-again-pre-k/materials/</p>
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>	<p>Delivery</p> <p>Choice of whole group instruction or small group instruction</p>
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>This curriculum is provided at no cost. Teachers can print all lesson plans from the website: http://ccec.ehe.osu.edu/practice/ccec-curricula/read-it-again-pre-k/materials/</p>	<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language
<p>Training</p> <p>Self-study materials (workbook, DVD) available at no cost; On-site professional development consisting of a 12-hour workshop, \$4995 (customized to meet identified needs)</p>	<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input type="checkbox"/> Early Writing
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p><i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> Manual</p>	

★	★	★	★
No evidence	Minimal evidence	Some evidence	Solid, high-quality evidence



READ IT AGAIN-PreK!

<p>Evidence-Based</p>		<p>At the time of the review, there was one study conducted on <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> was investigated using a quasi-experimental design (Justice et al., 2010). • Curriculum Implementation: Justice et al. (2010) reported that teachers implemented the curriculum with a high level of fidelity. • Replication/Generalization: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> was studied in one sample, and sample demographics allow the findings to be generalized to select groups.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child Outcomes: In a quasi-experimental study, Justice et al. (2010) found that children in the intervention group outperformed children in the comparison group across all language measures at the end of preschool. Small to moderate effects were demonstrated on children’s grammar ($d = 0.24$), morphology ($d = 0.35$), and vocabulary ($d = 0.17$), as measured by the Clinical Evaluation of Language Fundamentals (CELF).
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: Justice et al. (2010) found that children in the intervention group outperformed children in the comparison group in three of four literacy skill areas. Moderate effects were reported in the areas of rhyme ($d = 0.41$), alliteration ($d = 0.30$), and print concepts ($d = 0.44$), as measured by the Rhyming and Alliteration Individual Growth and Development Indicators (IGDI) and Preschool Word and Print Awareness Test (PWPA), respectively. There was no significant difference between intervention and comparison groups in alphabet knowledge, as measured by the Phonological Awareness Literacy Screening (PALS-PreK).
<p>Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.
<p>Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers all five domain elements: Book Appreciation & Knowledge, Phonological Awareness, Alphabet Knowledge, Print Concepts & Conventions, and Early Writing. While they do not include Early Writing as a specific instructional objective, there are numerous uses of shared writing in specific activities (e.g., Lesson 2, Lesson 12, and Lesson 58).
<p>Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers all four of the Receptive Language skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers all four of the Expressive Language skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element.



READ IT AGAIN-PreK!

<p>Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Book Appreciation & Knowledge: Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers three of the four Book Appreciation & Knowledge skills and has a clear instructional sequence with regard to book reading experiences. <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> primarily utilizes fictional storybooks and does not consistently address the following skill: Demonstrate interest in different kinds of literature, such as fiction and non-fiction books and poetry, on a range of topics. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Phonological Awareness: Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers three of the four Phonological Awareness skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element. <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Identify and discriminate between individual sounds/phonemes in language. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Alphabet Knowledge: Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers one of the four Alphabet Knowledge skills and does not have an identifiable sequence for this domain element. Letters are taught incidentally, and consequently, the curriculum does not consistently address the following skills: Identify most uppercase letters (18 or more); identify most lowercase letters (18 or more); and identify and produce the sounds associated with several letters. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Print Concepts & Conventions: Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers all four Print Concepts & Conventions skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence. • Organized Scope and Sequence—<i>Early Writing: Read It Again-PreK!</i> covers one of the four Early Writing skills. In this curriculum, teachers model writing, but the following skills are not consistently addressed: Experiment with writing tools and materials; use scribbles, shapes, pictures, and letters to represent objects, stories, experiences, or ideas; copy, trace, or independently write letters or words, including first name.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Read It Again-Pre-K!</i> specifies goals for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate. • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals and the learning activities. For example, in Lesson 1, there is a “Before the Reading” objective and an “After the Reading” objective. These objectives are directly linked to the Pupil Progress Checklist that is used to track individual student acquisition of the skills. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals for each learning activity and the scope and sequence.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Read It Again-Pre-K!</i> specifies goals for each learning activity that are specific, measurable, child-focused, and developmentally appropriate. • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals and the learning activities. For example, in Lesson 1, there is a “Before the Reading” objective and an “After the Reading” objective. These objectives are directly linked to the Pupil Progress Checklist that is used to track individual student acquisition of the skills. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: There is evidence of alignment between the learning goals for each learning activity and the scope and sequence.



READ IT AGAIN-PreK!

<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow an exact pattern across different activities. For example, in a book reading activity, there is a “Before” or a “Before and During”, and an “After” or “During and After” activity. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation. For example, the materials needed for the activity are clearly listed on each lesson page. There is also “Learners’ Ladder” guidance for each lesson that provides a guideline for making the lesson easier or more difficult. • Variety: While the activities are generally well designed, most lessons are centered on book-reading and then completing a discussion, with few opportunities for children to manipulate materials. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: Although the purpose of the activities seems clear, they are not explicitly stated in the manual.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow an exact pattern across different activities. For example, in a book reading activity, there is a “Before” or a “Before and During”, and an “After” or “During and After” activity. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation. For example, the materials needed for the activity are clearly listed on each lesson page. There is also “Learners’ Ladder” guidance for each lesson that provides guidelines for making the lesson easier or more difficult. • Variety: While the activities are generally well designed, most lessons are centered on book-reading and then completing a discussion, with few opportunities for children to manipulate materials. • Purpose of Activity Clear and Meaningful: Although the purpose of the activities seems clear, they are not explicitly stated in the manual.
<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: The lessons are primarily teacher-directed. For example, most of the lessons include a read aloud and then a discussion or an activity that is guided by the teacher. However, there are opportunities within the curriculum for child-focused strategies. For example, in Week 16, Lesson 31, teachers are directed to encourage children to tell about a time they imagined something. • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> offers strong support to teachers on how to provide high-quality interactions. This support is embedded within learning activities. For example, the Learners’ Ladder pages provide teachers with verbiage to guide children’s answers and help them to explain their thinking.
<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: Most learning activities provide activity-specific support for differentiation for children who are below cognitive or academic expectations. For example, the “Learners’ Ladder” provides strategies to make the materials easier or more challenging. In addition, on page 8 of the manual, there is a general section for how to help children when an activity is ‘too hard.’ • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive/Academic Expectations: Most learning activities provide activity-specific support for differentiation for children who are above cognitive or academic expectations. For example, the “Learners’ Ladder” provides strategies to make the materials easier or more challenging. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: No guidance is provided. • Material Adaptation: No guidance is provided. • Environment Adaptation: No guidance is provided.



READ IT AGAIN-PreK!

<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: The materials are only provided in English. • Materials Represent Diversity: Most materials represent a single culture; however, there are some picture and word cards that include male and female images, and some of the text incorporates examples with diverse children’s names (e.g., <i>Angel, Cole, and Portia</i>). • Support for Dual-Language Learners: No guidance is provided. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: No guidance is provided.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: There is evidence that suggested assessments align with learning goals covered in learning activities. For example, the Pupil Progress Checklist for vocabulary and narrative directly duplicates objectives listed in the scope and sequence of the individual lessons. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: The Pupil Progress Checklist aligns with the Language Development outcomes on the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework. • Using Assessment Information: The Pupil Progress Checklist provides a section in the introduction regarding the importance of monitoring children’s progress. However, there is no explicit explanation on how interpret the assessment information or how to use the assessment results to adapt future instruction. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The Pupil Progress Checklist is easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence provided that the suggested assessments are based on sound child development principles, and there is no evidence provided that the assessment has been validated and linked to children’s outcomes.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: There is evidence that suggested assessments align with learning goals covered in learning activities. For example, the Pupil Progress Checklist for print awareness and phonological awareness directly duplicates objectives listed in the scope and sequence of the individual lessons. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: The Pupil Progress Checklist aligns with the Literacy Knowledge & Skills outcomes on the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework. • Using Assessment Information: The Pupil Progress Checklist provides a section in the introduction regarding the importance of monitoring children’s progress. However, there is no explicit explanation on how to interpret the assessment information or how to use the assessment results to adapt future instruction. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The Pupil Progress Checklist is easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence provided that the suggested assessments are based on sound child development principles, and there is no evidence provided that the assessment has been validated and linked to children’s outcomes.



READ IT AGAIN-PreK!

<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: There is comprehensive initial training provided to teachers that covers in depth the content related to implementing <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i>. For example, there are self-study materials available free of charge on the curriculum website, and there is on-site professional development available for a fee. • Continued Professional Development: There is no evidence that <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> provides professional development beyond the initial training. • Level of Individualization: <i>Read It Again-PreK!</i> provides a moderate level of individualization. For example, the schedule can be customized to fit the center's different needs. Other Program Staff: The professional development materials are mostly geared towards teachers; however, it appears that other adults are welcomed without modified content. • Multiple Modes: There are multiple modes of professional development available; for example, there are video clips, workbooks, and in-person training. • Evidence of Validation: There is no evidence that the professional development has been validated or linked to improved teacher practices.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: No materials are provided. • Teacher Guidance: No guidance is provided. • Incorporating Family Volunteers in Classroom: No guidance is provided. • Parent-Teacher Relationships: No guidance is provided.



<h2>World of Words (WOW)</h2>	<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p>The <i>World of Words (WOW)</i> curriculum integrates multiple sources of information and technology to stimulate children’s oral language development in content areas aligned with national pre-kindergarten standards. <i>World of Words</i> uses nonfiction books and child-friendly media to support children’s learning as they encounter new words and concepts in science, mathematics, social studies, and health. Throughout the curriculum, teachers guide children through exercises to increase language skills while developing their knowledge and vocabulary in academic content areas.</p> <p>Neuman, S. B., Dwyer, J., Koh, S., & Wright, T. (2007). <i>World of Words</i>. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://www.umich.edu/~rdytolrn/wow.html</p>
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>	<p>Delivery</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whole Group Instruction • Small Group Instruction • Learning Centers
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>This curriculum is provided at no cost from the developers. Contact information can be found at this link: http://www.umich.edu/~rdytolrn/r2rcontact.html</p>	<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language
<p>Training</p> <p>Information regarding professional development unavailable for review.</p>	<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input type="checkbox"/> Early Writing
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p>Teachers’ manuals for 4 topics; 4 shared reading books per topic; set of picture cards per topic</p>	

<p>No evidence</p>	<p>Minimal evidence</p>	<p>Some evidence</p>	<p>Solid, high-quality evidence</p>
--------------------	-------------------------	----------------------	-------------------------------------



WORLD OF WORDS (WOW)

Evidence-Based		<p>At the time of the review, there were five studies conducted on World of Words.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: <i>World of Words</i> has been investigated using both an experimental design and a quasi-experimental design (Neuman & Dwyer, 2011; Neuman & Kaefer, 2013; Neuman, Kaefer, & Pinkham, in press; Neuman, Newman, & Dwyer, 2011; Neuman, Pinkham, & Kaefer, in press). • Curriculum Implementation: Multiple studies reported that teachers implemented the curriculum with a high level of fidelity. • Replication/Generalization: <i>World of Words</i> has been studied in a sample that reflects ethnic/racial diversity, and sample demographics allow the findings to be generalized to select groups.
Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Child Outcomes: In a 16-week, quasi-experimental investigation, Neuman and Dwyer (2011) found that the children in the intervention group made greater gains than the children in the control group on curriculum-related expressive vocabulary, with a moderate effect ($d = 0.64$). In a subsequent quasi-experimental study, Neuman, Kaefer, & Pinkham (in press) reported very large positive effects on curriculum-related receptive vocabulary ($d = 1.10$). In a larger 24-week experimental study, Neuman and colleagues (2011) reported moderate to large effects on curriculum-related vocabulary across the units of the curriculum ($ds = 0.44 - 0.86$). In another experimental study, Neuman, Pinkham, & Kaefer (in press) reported positive effects on curriculum-based receptive vocabulary and comprehension ($d = 0.69$). Across these studies, there were no differences between intervention and control groups on standardized tests of receptive vocabulary (Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test) and expressive vocabulary (Woodcock-Johnson III Tests of Achievement Picture Vocabulary Test).
Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills	n/a	This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component
Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>World of Words</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.
Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements	n/a	This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.
Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>World of Words</i> covers all four of the Receptive Language Skills. A clear instructional sequence for this domain element was difficult to identify. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>World of Words</i> covers all four of the Expressive Language Skills. A clear instructional sequence for this domain element was difficult to identify.
Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element	n/a	This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.



WORLD OF WORDS (WOW)

<p>Specific Learning Goals for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: While the learning objectives are child focused and developmentally appropriate, they are not specific, and thus, difficult to measure. For example, most of the learning goals are written as, “Children will learn...” or “Children will gain a deeper understanding of...” • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is evidence of an alignment between the learning goals and the activities, but the pieces of the activities are not labeled to match components of the objective. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: <i>World of Words</i> does not provide a scope and sequence for the Language Development domain.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The learning activities are logical and follow a similar pattern across different activities. • Ease of Implementation: There are multiple supports provided to facilitate implementation. For example, the materials needed for the activity, teacher tips, and directions are clearly listed on each lesson page. • Variety: <i>World of Words</i> prompts teachers to use a variety of strategies, modalities, and interactive materials. • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: While <i>World of Words</i> provides the purpose of the activity (e.g., “Why Do It This Way?”), these purposes are not consistently provided for all parts of the lessons or the lesson as a whole.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: <i>World of Words</i> provides both child-focused and teacher-directed activities. It provides room for incorporating children’s perspectives through allowing children to explore and learn more about topics (e.g., Insects) on their own. • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: <i>World of Words</i> provides some general guidelines for teacher-child interactions. Teacher’s Tips are provided sporadically throughout the teacher’s manual that gives guidelines for high-quality interactions with children.
<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: There is no evidence provided. • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive/Academic Expectations: There is no evidence provided. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: There is no evidence provided. • Material Adaptation: No guidance is provided. • Environment Adaptation: No guidance is provided.



WORLD OF WORDS (WOW)

<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: <i>World of Words</i> only provides materials in English. • Materials Represent Diversity: Some of the materials represent diversity of language and culture; however, there is no information about how to select materials to be culturally representative. • Support Dual-Language Learners: No guidance is provided. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: No guidance is provided.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: <i>World of Words</i> does not provide assessments. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: <i>World of Words</i> does not provide assessments. • Using Assessment Information: <i>World of Words</i> does not provide assessments. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: <i>World of Words</i> does not provide assessments. • Validated Assessments: <i>World of Words</i> does not provide assessments.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>	<p>n/a</p>	<p>This is a language-focused curriculum; therefore, we did not evaluate this component.</p>
<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: Information regarding professional development unavailable for review. • Continued Professional Development: Information regarding professional development unavailable for review. • Level of Individualization: Information regarding professional development unavailable for review. • Other Program Staff: Information regarding professional development unavailable for review. • Multiple Modes: Information regarding professional development unavailable for review. • Validated Professional Development: Information regarding professional development unavailable for review.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: No materials are provided. • Teacher Guidance: Minimal guidance is provided to teachers on how to link learning goals to home. Teachers are directed to send home copies of books to read with family members at home. • Incorporating Family Volunteers: No guidance is provided. • Parent-Teacher Relationships: No guidance is provided.



<h2>Zoo-phonics® Multisensory Language Arts Program</h2>	<p>Curriculum Description</p> <p>The <i>Zoo-phonics® Multisensory Language Arts Program</i> is a kinesthetic, multi-modal approach to learning language arts, including vocabulary development, based on phonics and phonemic awareness. A key feature of <i>Zoo-phonics®</i> is the use of animals drawn in the shapes of letters to help children remember letter-sounds.</p> <p>Zoo-phonics, Inc. (2014). <i>Zoo-phonics</i>.</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://www.zoo-phonics.com/about.html</p>
<p>Target Population</p> <p>Preschool children, ages 3–5</p>	<p>Delivery</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whole Group Instruction • Small Group Instruction • Learning Centers
<p>Cost per Classroom</p> <p>The Preschool Kit: \$329.95</p> <p>The Preschool Zoo-per Package: \$599.95</p> <p>Preschool Zoo-per Upgrade: \$349.95</p> <p>The ELL Kit: \$419.95</p> <p>Retrieved from: http://www.zoo-phonics.com/products_kits_zoopers.html</p>	<p>Language Development Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Receptive Language <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Expressive Language
<p>Training</p> <p>Initial training is provided in person via a one-day workshop (\$99) or through DVDs. An advanced workshop and make-and-take workshops are available for continued professional development.</p>	<p>Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements Covered</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Book Appreciation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Phonological Awareness <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alphabet Knowledge <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Print Concepts & Conventions <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Early Writing
<p>Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters</p> <p>Teaching Manual (Adventures in Learning), large animal alphabet picture cards (upper- and lower-case), small animal alphabet cards, small animal alphabet merged animal/letter cards (upper- and lower-case), Music that Teaches CD, Adventuresome Kids CD, Signal Practice DVD, alphabet grid set, activity worksheets, Zoo-kids signal poster, vowel puppets, Quick Tests for the Classroom</p>	

★	★	★	★
No evidence	Minimal evidence	Some evidence	Solid, high-quality evidence



ZOO-PHONICS® MULTISENSORY LANGUAGE ARTS PROGRAM

<p>Evidence-Based</p>		<p>At the time of this review, there were no available peer-reviewed research studies conducted with a preschool sample of children using <i>Zoo-phonics</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Research Rigor: n/a • Curriculum Implementation: n/a • Replication/Generalization: n/a
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: No studies have been conducted.
<p>Effects on Child Outcomes for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evidence of Child Outcomes: No studies have been conducted.
<p>Comprehensive Across Language Development Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers both Receptive Language and Expressive Language throughout the curriculum.
<p>Comprehensive Across Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Elements</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of Domain Elements Covered: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers all five domain elements: Book Appreciation & Knowledge, Phonological Awareness, Alphabet Knowledge, Print Concepts & Conventions, and Early Writing.
<p>Depth for Each Covered Language Development Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Receptive Language: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers three of the four Receptive Language skills and has a vague instructional sequence for this domain element. <i>Zoo-phonics</i> does not consistently address the following skill: Comprehend a wide variety of words. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Expressive Language: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers two of the four Expressive Language skills and has a vague instructional sequence for this domain element. <i>Zoo-phonics</i> does not consistently address the following skills: Engage in extended conversations with peers and adults; and use a wide variety of words.
<p>Depth for Each Covered Literacy Knowledge & Skills Domain Element</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organized Scope and Sequence—Book Appreciation & Knowledge: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers all four of the Book Appreciation & Knowledge skills, but has a vague instructional sequence for this domain element. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Phonological Awareness: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers two of the four Phonological Awareness skills and has a vague instructional sequence for this domain element. <i>Zoo-phonics</i> does not consistently address the following skills: Identify and produce rhyming words; and identify and discriminate between separate syllables in words. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Alphabet Knowledge: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers all four of the Alphabet Knowledge skills and has an identifiable instructional sequence for this domain element, with one letter-name and sound introduced each week (moving from a to z). • Organized Scope and Sequence—Print Concepts & Conventions: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers all four of the Print Concepts & Conventions skills, but has a vague instructional sequence for this domain element. • Organized Scope and Sequence—Early Writing: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> covers three of the four Early Writing skills. This curriculum focuses on writing alphabet letters, but the following skill is not consistently addressed: Use scribbles, shapes, pictures, and letters to represent objects, stories, experiences, or ideas.



ZOO-PHONICS® MULTISENSORY LANGUAGE ARTS PROGRAM

<p>Specific Learning Goals for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> does not provide specific learning goals for the activities that are language related. • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: Due to the lack of learning goals, there is no alignment between the goals and the learning activities. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: Due to the lack of learning goals, there is no alignment between the goals and scope and sequence.
<p>Specific Learning Goals for Literacy Knowledge and Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Goals or Objectives: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides learning goals in very broad categories; for example, each day’s lesson is broken into two segments: Phonemic Awareness/Pre-Writing Experiences and Literacy – Knowledge and Appreciation of Books; and each learning activity does not have specific goals. Under the literacy “goal”, the teacher is directed to read a poem to the children, discuss the humor, and then read another poem to the children. The objectives for these activities are not provided. • Alignment between Goals and Learning Activities: There is some alignment between the goals and learning activities; however, these are provided in vague terms. • Alignment between Goals and Scope and Sequence: There is some alignment between the goals and scope and sequence, however, these are provided in vague terms.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: While the language-specific learning activities are easy to follow, they do not share a similar pattern across different activities. For example, on Day 4 of Chapter 16, Page 159, the teacher is directed to ask the children if they have a pretend playmate and then give them time to share. On Day 3 of Chapter 14, Page 142, the teacher is directed to call out sleep-related words and have children supply the animals. • Ease of Implementation: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides some supports to facilitate implementation. For example, on the first page of each chapter, there is a list of materials needed for the week; there are important notes for the teacher highlighted in the beginning of each chapter; and there are ideas for extending the lessons through each chapter. • Variety: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> prompts teachers to use multiple strategies (e.g., whole group, small group, individual instruction, and interactive materials). • Purpose of Activity Is Clear and Meaningful: The purpose of the language-specific activities is listed under broad objectives.
<p>Well-Designed Learning Activities for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organization of Learning Activities: The literacy-specific learning activities are logical and follow a similar pattern across different activities. For example, each letter is introduced in the same manner and repeated multiple times throughout the week. The routine is methodical and easy to follow (see Chapter 2, pp. 58–63 for an example of the organization of Book Appreciation & Knowledge, Phonological Awareness, Alphabet Knowledge, Print Concepts & Conventions, and Early Writing). • Ease of Implementation: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides some support to facilitate implementation. For example, on the first page of each chapter, there is a list of materials needed for the week; there are important notes for the teacher highlighted in the beginning of each chapter; and there are ideas for extending the lessons through each chapter. • Variety: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> prompts teachers to use multiple strategies (e.g., whole group, small group, individual instruction), and there are many materials that children can use to practice their literacy skills. For example, children have opportunities to practice writing letters and words using sand/salt trays and shaving cream. They also have the opportunity to use their fingers to write in the air and make the letter shapes using their bodies. • Purpose of Activity Clear and Meaningful: While the literacy-specific activities are generally well designed, the purposes of the activities are listed under very broad objectives; a purpose is not listed for the individual activities within each broad goal.



ZOO-PHONICS® MULTISENSORY LANGUAGE ARTS PROGRAM

<p>Responsive Teaching</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Variety of Strategies: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides teaching strategies that are primarily teacher-directed, although teachers take into account children’s perspectives and thoughts throughout the day. Teachers read books to children and direct discussions around books. Small group instruction is teacher-directed as well, with children practicing making letters, learning poems, or making animal stick puppets. However, there are some instances of child-focused learning (e.g., child-dictated writing activities). • Guidelines for Teacher-Child Interactions: Brief guidelines are provided for high-quality, teacher-child interactions on page 33 of the teacher’s manual. Teachers are reminded to, “Talk to your children daily. Give them eye contact and plenty of opportunities to ask and answer questions, retell stories and events. Actively listen.”
<p>Supports for Individualized Instruction</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support for Children Performing below Cognitive/Academic Expectations: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides a section in the teacher’s manual titled, “How Can We Reach Every Child in Every Academic Subject?”, but the suggestions are very general and do not provide support for differentiation for children who are below cognitive or academic expectations. • Support for Children Performing above Cognitive/Academic Expectations: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides some support for differentiation for children who are above cognitive or academic expectations; however, they are not provided consistently across different learning activities. • Differentiating Support for Children with Physical and/or Emotional Needs: There is no evidence provided. • Material Adaptation: No guidance is provided. • Environment Adaptation: No guidance is provided.
<p>Culturally and Linguistically Responsive</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials Represent Diversity of Language: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides multiple materials for use inside the classroom and for families (e.g., instructional cards, bilingual instructional manual). • Materials Represent Diversity: The materials represent a diversity of culture, as the letter card animals are from various countries, prompting activities such as cooking African recipes and listening to African languages. In each chapter, there is suggested literature that represents diversity in terms of culture, ethnicity, and gender (see Chapter 8, p. 102 and Chapter 23, p. 216). • Support Dual-Language Learners: The basic kit does not provide support for assisting dual-language classrooms. Additional DLL kits are available for purchase. • Meeting Cultural Needs Specific to a Center: No guidance is provided.
<p>Ongoing Assessments for Language Development</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides language-related assessments, but it is unclear whether they align with learning activities in the curriculum. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: Assessments include receptive and expressive language skills, but these minimally align with the descriptions of the domain elements of the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework. For example, the Quick Tests for the Classroom include tests that ask children to repeat phrases and match a small set of words to objects. • Using Assessment Information: Some general guidance is provided at the front of the Quick Tests for the Classroom manual. Each test provides guidance on how to help students move forward in their learning. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The provided assessments are easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. • Validated Assessments: There is no evidence that the assessments have been validated or linked to positive learning outcomes.



ZOO-PHONICS® MULTISENSORY LANGUAGE ARTS PROGRAM

<p>Ongoing Assessments for Literacy Knowledge & Skills</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful Alignment to Learning Activities: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides literacy-related assessments that align with the learning activities. For example, children are asked to recite the alphabet by letter-name or letter-sound, and identify the shape, sound, and/or signal of the lowercase animal alphabet when presented in a sequence. • Meaningful Alignment to Head Start Outcomes: Assessments provided cover the Alphabet Knowledge, Phonological Awareness and Early Writing domain elements of the Head Start Child Development Early Learning Framework. There are no assessments that align with Book Appreciation or Print Concepts & Conventions. • Using Assessment Information: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides minimal instruction for teachers to reflect on the assessment information, and there is no support provided for how to adapt future instruction. • Teacher-friendly Assessments: The provided assessments are easily accessible, user-friendly, and efficient to implement. • Validated Assessments: Although there is evidence that assessments are based on sound child development principles, there is no evidence that the assessments have been validated or linked to positive learning outcomes.
<p>Professional Development Opportunities</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial Training: <i>Zoo-phonics</i> provides comprehensive initial training through workshops and DVDs. • Continued Professional Development: An advanced workshop and make-and-take workshops are available as indicated on the curriculum's website (www.zoo-phonics.com/training.html), but specific information regarding the content was unavailable for review. • Level of Individualization: The <i>Zoo-phonics</i> website does not provide information regarding the level of individualization. • Other Program Staff: While other staff (e.g., aides, administrators, special education teachers) are encouraged to attend the professional development, there is no modified content. • Multiple Modes: The professional development is available in person at a workshop and on a DVD. • Evidence of Validation: There is no evidence that the professional development has been validated or linked to improved teacher practices.
<p>Family Involvement Materials</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials: Materials are regularly sent home with children, so parents know the letter sound and shape to be taught (e.g., Parent Support section on pages 49, 66, 74). • Teacher Guidance: Specific guidance is provided to teachers on how to link learning goals to home in a meaningful way (e.g., family literacy nights). Throughout the lessons, teachers are reminded to send home copies of instructional materials for parents to use at home. • Incorporating Family Volunteers: General guidance is provided on how to use family volunteers in the classroom. On page 10 of the teacher's manual, the authors suggest that many of the listed activities in each lesson plan can be made into center activities that can be led by a volunteer. • Parent-Teacher Relationships: In the Home Connection portion of the teacher's manual (pp. 43–47), the authors suggest a few ways to establish and maintain positive parent-teacher relationships.



REFERENCES

- Barnard, W. M. (2004). Parent involvement in elementary school and educational attainment. *Children & Youth Services Review, 26*, 39–62.
- Barnett, W. S. (2008). *Preschool education and its lasting effects: Research and policy implications*. Retrieved from Boulder and Tempe: Education and the Public Interest Center & Education Policy Research Unit website: www.epicpolicy.org/publication/preschool-education
- Chambers, B., Cheung, A., Slavin, R. E., Smith, D., & Laurenzano, M. (2010). *Effective early childhood education programs: A systematic review*. Retrieved from: http://www.bestevidence.org/word/early_child_ed_Sep_22_2010.pdf
- Chang, F., Crawford, G., Early, D., Bryant, D., Howes, C., Burchinal, M., ... Pianta, R. C. (2007). Spanish-speaking children's social and language development in pre-kindergarten classrooms. *Early Education and Development, 18*, 243–269.
- Galinsky, E. (2006). *The economic benefits of high-quality early childhood programs: What makes the difference?* Washington, DC: The Committee for Economic Development.
- Joseph, G., & Strain, P. (2003). Comprehensive evidence-based social-emotional curricula for young children: An analysis of efficacious adoption potential. *Topics in Early Childhood Special Education, 23*, 65–76.
- Mashburn, A. J., Pianta, R. C., Barbarin, O. A., Bryant, D., Hamre, B. K., Downer, J. T., ... Howes, C. (2008). Measures of classroom quality in prekindergarten and children's development of academic, language, and social skills. *Child Development, 79*, 732–749.
- National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning. (2010). *Choosing a Preschool Curriculum*. Retrieved from Head Start: An Office of the Administration for Children and Families Early Childhood Learning & Knowledge Center website: <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/docs/preschool-curriculum.pdf>
- National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning. (2011). *Curriculum, Assessment, and the Head Start Framework: An Alignment Tool*. Retrieved from Head Start: An Office of the Administration for Children and Families Early Childhood Learning & Knowledge Center website: <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/docs/alignment-guide.pdf>
- Neuman, S. B., & Kaefer, T. (2013). Enhancing the intensity of vocabulary instruction for preschoolers at risk. *The Elementary School Journal, 113*, 589–608.
- Pianta, R. C., Mashburn, A. J., Downer, J. T., Hamre, B. K., & Justice, L. (2008). Effects of web-mediated professional development resources on teacher-child interactions in pre-kindergarten classrooms. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 23*, 431–451.
- Ramey, S. L., & Ramey, C. (1992). Early educational intervention with disadvantaged children—To what effect? *Applied and Preventive Psychology, 1*, 131–140.
- Winsler, A., Diaz, R. M., Espinosa, L., & Rodriguez, J. L. (1999). When learning a second language does not mean losing first: Bilingual language development in low-income, Spanish-speaking children attending bilingual preschool. *Child Development, 70*, 349–362.



REFERENCES REVIEWED FOR COMPONENT 2 (CURRICULUM SHOWS EFFECTS ON CHILD OUTCOMES)

Developing Talkers

Zucker, T. A., Solari, E. J., Landry, S. H., & Swank, P. R. (2013). Effects of a brief tiered language intervention for prekindergartners at risk. *Early Education and Development, 24*, 366–392.

Doors to Discovery

Assel, M. A., Landry, S. H., Swank, P. R., & Gunnewig, S. (2007). An evaluation of curriculum, setting, and mentoring on the performance of children enrolled in pre-kindergarten. *Reading and Writing: An Interdisciplinary Journal, 20*, 463–494.

Han, M., Roskos, K., Christie, J., Mandzuk, S., & Vukelich, C. (2005). Learning words: Large group time as a vocabulary development opportunity. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education, 19*, 333–345.

Preschool Curriculum Evaluation Research Consortium (2008). *Effects of Preschool Curriculum Programs on School Readiness* (NCER 2008–2009). National Center for Education Research, Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education. Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.

Literacy Express

Farver, J. M., Lonigan, C. J., & Eppe, S. (2009). Effective early literacy skill development for young Spanish-speaking English language learners: An experimental study of two methods. *Child Development, 80*, 703–719.

Lonigan, C. J., Farver, J. M., Phillips, B. M., & Clancy-Menchetti, J. (2011). Promoting the development of preschool children's emergent literacy skills: A randomized evaluation of literacy-focused curriculum and two professional development models. *Reading and Writing: An Interdisciplinary Journal, 24*, 305–337.

Preschool Curriculum Evaluation Research Consortium (2008). *Effects of Preschool Curriculum Programs on School Readiness* (NCER 2008–2009). National Center for Education Research, Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education. Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office.

PAVEd for Success

Schwanenflugel, P. J., Hamilton, C. E., Neuharth-Pritchett, S., Restrepo, M. A., Bradley, B. A., & Webb, M. (2010). PAVEd for success: An evaluation of a comprehensive preliteracy program for four-year-old children. *Journal of Literacy Research, 42*, 227–275.

Read It Again-PreK!

Justice, L. M., McGinty, A. S., Cabell, S. Q., Kilday, C. R., Knighton, K., & Huffman, G. (2010). Language and literacy curriculum supplement for preschoolers who are academically at risk: A feasibility study. *Language, Speech, and Hearing Services in Schools, 41*, 161–178.

World of Words

Neuman, S. B., & Dwyer, J. (2011). Developing vocabulary and conceptual knowledge for low-income preschoolers: A design experiment. *Journal of Literacy Research, 43*, 103–129.

Neuman, S. B., Kaefer, T., & Pinkham, A. M. (in press). Improving low-income preschoolers' word and world knowledge: The effects of content-rich instruction. *The Elementary School Journal*.

Neuman, S. B., Newman, E. H., & Dwyer, J. (2011). Educational effects of a vocabulary intervention on preschoolers' word knowledge and conceptual development: A cluster-randomized trial. *Reading Research Quarterly, 46*, 249–272.

Neuman, S. B., Pinkham, A., & Kaefer, T. (in press). Supporting vocabulary teaching and learning in preK: The role of educative curriculum materials. *Early Education and Development*.

Zoo-phonics® Multisensory Language Arts Program

At the time of this review, there were no available research studies conducted for Zoo-phonics with a preschool sample of children in published, peer-reviewed journals.

APPENDIX A: DETAILS ABOUT THE REVIEW PROCESS

Selection of Reviewers

Curriculum reviewers were required to have an advanced degree (either MA or PhD) in Early Childhood Education, Child Development, or a related field. They were also required to have research or field experience in early childhood education or early childhood development. In total we had nine reviewers rate the curricula.

Training of Reviewers

Trainees were required to complete 10 to 15 hours of training before rating any of the curricula. They were first required to read the following background material:

- The Head Start Child Development and Early Learning Framework
- A checklist of Steps on How to Evaluate Pre-K Curricula

Trainees then carefully examined the rating rubric. Once they felt that they understood the rating rubric, they were given a practice curriculum to review and rate. This curriculum had been previously independently reviewed by three core reviewers. These core reviewers met together, came to a consensus for each rating of the practice curriculum, and provided a detailed justification for each criterion within each component. Trainees compared their individual ratings and justifications with the consensus ratings and justifications created by the core reviewers. Trainees met with one of the core reviewers to discuss issues that arose from this practice training. Once all questions were clarified, trainees were considered reviewers and were provided with curricula to independently review.

Review Process

Two reviewers, who were not associated with the curriculum, independently reviewed all curricular materials thoroughly. Each used the rubric to determine a rating for each criterion within each of the 12 components. Additionally, the reviewer wrote a rationale for each rating. Component ratings were determined by averaging the evidence across the criteria within the respective component. Each reviewer spent approximately 8 to 10 hours reviewing, scoring, and writing rationales for each component.

Ratings and justifications were provided to the NCQTL language and literacy curriculum team at the University of Virginia. An individual who did not serve as a reviewer compiled the ratings and rationales for each curriculum. This individual reviewed both sets of ratings and rationales. If discrepancies existed between the two sets of ratings, both reviewers were asked to discuss the discrepancies and come up with the final rating and rationale.



For more information, contact us at: NCQTL@UW.EDU or 877-731-0764

This document was prepared under Grant #90HC0002 for the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Head Start, by the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning.

SUMMER 2015

APPENDIX B: DETAILED DESCRIPTION OF INCLUDED TABLES

The first table includes:

- Curriculum Description: A brief description of the curriculum
- Delivery: How the curriculum is administered (e.g., whole group, small group, individuals, pairs)
- Covered Learning Domain Elements: If the majority of skills for a particular domain element (see below) were covered, this is indicated with a symbol next to the domain element. If the majority of skills were not covered, this is indicated with a next to the domain element.
- Target Population: Intended audience of the curriculum
- Cost per Classroom: Total cost of curricular materials (e.g., manipulative kit, assessment materials, total curriculum package)
- Training: Professional development opportunities offered by the publishers, as well as the cost
- Curriculum Materials Reviewed by Raters: Curricular materials included in the review

The second table includes:

- Ratings for each of the 12 components
- A rationale for the rating



For more information, contact us at: NCQTL@UW.EDU or 877-731-0764

This document was prepared under Grant #90HC0002 for the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Head Start, by the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning.

SUMMER 2015

APPENDIX C: LIST OF CURRICULUM RESOURCES

Following is a list of resources that are available to help programs choose and implement an early childhood education curriculum:

- **Linguistically and Culturally Relevant Early Childhood Environments**

The importance of culturally and linguistically diverse environments is described. This resource can be used to better understand Component 9. http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/cultural-linguistic/Dual%20Language%20Learners/eecd/supportive_environments/Linguisticallyan.html

- **Parent, Family, and Community Engagement Framework — Head Start Approach to School Readiness**

The importance of family and community involvement in the education of children is addressed. This resource can be used to better understand Component 12. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/sr/approach/pfcef>

- **Head Start Approach to School Readiness — Overview**

A full report on the School Readiness approach is included on this page. Part of school readiness depends on having the appropriate curriculum, along with various other elements. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/sr/approach/>

- **Office of Head Start Summit – On the Road to School Readiness**

This page describes the Head Start Summit from February 2011. These is information on school readiness, the roles of curriculum, ongoing assessment and instruction, and using data for program self-assessment/improvement. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/hs/calendar/summit>

- **Using What You Learn from Observation – A Form of Assessment**

This page describes the purpose of ongoing assessment and observation. This resource can be used to better understand Component 10. http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/eecd/Assessment/Ongoing%20Assessment/edudev_art_00070_080505.html

- **Services to Children with Disabilities**

This page describes differentiation for children with various disabilities. This resource can be helpful in understanding Component 8. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/Disabilities/Services%20to%20Children%20with%20Disabilities>

- **Planning and Curriculum**

This page has information on the definition and requirements of curriculum, planning to choose a preschool curriculum, the roles of staff/parents in curriculum, and teaching strategies for children who are advanced or perform below average. This resource can be used to understand Components 8, 11, and 12. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/eecd/Curriculum>

- **Curriculum, Assessment and The Head Start Framework: An Alignment Review Tool**

This resource is designed to help programs determine how well an early childhood assessment or curriculum aligns with the domains and domain elements identified in the HSCDELF. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/docs/alignment-guide.pdf>

- **Choosing a Preschool Curriculum**

This guide is designed to help programs make informed decisions about choosing a preschool curriculum and assuring high-quality implementation of the curriculum in their programs. <http://eclkc.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/hslc/tta-system/teaching/practice/curricula/docs/curriculum-choosing.pdf>



For more information, contact us at: NCQTL@UW.EDU or 877-731-0764

This document was prepared under Grant #90HC0002 for the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Head Start, by the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning.

SUMMER 2015

APPENDIX D: DEPTH OF COVERAGE FOR DOMAIN ELEMENTS

Name of Curriculum	LANGUAGE DEVELOPMENT DOMAIN ELEMENTS		LITERACY KNOWLEDGE & SKILLS DOMAIN ELEMENTS				
	Receptive Language	Expressive Language	Book Appreciation	Phonological Awareness	Alphabet Knowledge	Print Concepts & Conventions	Early Writing
<i>Developing Talkers</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Doors to Discover</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
<i>Literacy Express</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
<i>PAVEd for Success</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Read It Again-PreK!</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>World of Words (WOW)</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<i>Zoo-phonics® Multisensory Language Arts Program</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Curriculum covered at least half of the skills for the domain element	Curriculum did not cover the majority of skills for the domain element

See pages 4–8 for a list of skills for each domain element.



For more information, contact us at: NCQTL@UW.EDU or 877-731-0764

This document was prepared under Grant #90HC0002 for the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Head Start, by the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning.

SUMMER 2015

APPENDIX E: LIST OF REPORTS EXAMINED

In addition to peer-reviewed research reports, the following reports and websites were examined for curricula meeting our criteria (in alphabetical order):

Developing Early Literacy: Report of the National Early Literacy Panel (NELP)

<http://lincs.ed.gov/publications/pdf/NELPReport09.pdf>

Effective Early Childhood Education Programs: A Systematic Review

http://www.bestevidence.org/word/early_child_ed_Sep_22_2010.pdf

Effects of Preschool Curriculum Programs on School Readiness: Report from the Preschool Curriculum Evaluation Research Initiative (PCER)

<http://ies.ed.gov/pubsearch/pubsinfo.asp?pubid=NCER20082009rev>

What Works Clearing House, Institute of Education Sciences (reviews of curricula)

www.whatworks.ed.gov



For more information, contact us at: NCQTL@UW.EDU or 877-731-0764

This document was prepared under Grant #90HC0002 for the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Head Start, by the National Center on Quality Teaching and Learning.

SUMMER 2015